Tamkang Review 42.2 (June 2012): 163-189.

Gardening Ideas across Borders: Mobilities and Sustainability in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Gardens in the Dunes**

Chi-szu Chen
Tamkang University

Abstract

Leslie Marmon Silko's novel, *Gardens in the Dunes*, is an exemplar revisionist travel narrative that reveals multiple dimensions of its genre by weaving three types of action-traveling, story-telling, and gardening—with three related themes—mobility, seeding, and healing. Through traveling, different species and ideas are disseminated and hybridized. Through story-telling, the interference or concurrence of ideas, which are complicated with related socio-political values, are dramatized in a contested way. Through gardening, seeds of plants and ideas are planted, nurtured, inter-pollinated, domesticated, and absorbed into the local ecosystem and social milieu, impacting neighboring communities. Different kinds of gardens (kitchen garden, fruit garden, botanist garden, landscape garden) are managed with diverse gardening ideals, reflecting a diversity of cultures and mobilities. The means of gardening of plants and of ideas demonstrate how sustainable ideas help to maintain sustainable communities endangered by colonial and capitalist exploitation.

The stories of the transnational and cross-cultural traveling of the white and indigenous mixed blood characters across national and cultural borders chronicle the scenarios of diverse and uneven production of mobility. The crisscrossing between routes of migration and roots of acculturation constitutes a relief map of cultural survival and environmental sustainment in an

---

Chi-szu Chen received his Ph.D. from Tamkang University. His research areas include Visual Theory, Ecocriticism, and Native American Literature. He has published critical essays on environmental ethics and landscape painting, and articles on Native American writers, such as Margo Tamez, Leslie Marmon Silko, and N. Scott Momaday. He is currently teaching at Department of English of Tamkang University.
E-mail: kiss7445@mail.tku.edu.tw

*Part of this essay appeared in "The 4th Tamkang International Conference on Ecological Discourse," (23~24, May, 2008, Tamkang University), with a slightly different title: "Gardening Ideas across Borders: Sustainable Principles in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Gardens in the Dunes*."

(Received 12 April 2010; accepted 15 April 2012)

endangered mobile world. With the inter-pollinated implications of travel, gardening, and story-telling, Silko offers a global vision of "interior journey" that articulates a sense of planet community and provides strategies for a sustainable community and future.

Keywords: mobility, sustainability, travel, gardening, seed-thought

Travel writing in Western literature has been a genre predominated by male characters, sexist ideology, and colonial desire. In *The Mind of the Traveler*, Eric J. Leed calls traveling a "gendering activity" that highlights a sexist opposition: "There is no free and mobile male without the unfree and sessile female, no knight without the lady, no father without the mother" (217). Leed observes that for woman travelers, their journeys "are secret, necessitated, or accomplished through the agency of men" (221). In *Discourse of Difference*, Sara Milles calls attentions to the relation between the discourse of femininity and that of colonialism in 19th and early 20th century British women's travel writing. Milles contends that female travel writers "were at one and the same time part of the colonial enterprise, and yet marginalized within it" (106). Marilyn C. Wesley, another feminist scholar of this field, focuses on the deconstructive and reconstructive alternatives in her study on female travel writing. In *Secret Journeys: The Trope of Women's Travel in American Literature*, Wesley argues that for contemporary female writers of this genre, "the trope of women's travel is a dynamic means of expressing contradictions within, alternatives to, ambivalence about, and reformations of varied controlling conditions," which they want to deconstruct or reconstruct (xvi). For her, such a trope

> functions as a structure for the expression of difference—from feminine restriction, political circumstance, and imperialist expectations—that conveys alternative possibility for development rather than the exploitation symbolized by the contrastive adventure of the male traveler. . . . (xiii)

Leslie Marmon Silko's novel, *Gardens in the Dunes*, is an exemplar revisionist travel narrative that reveals multiple dimensions of such a genre by weaving three types of action—traveling, story-telling, and gardening—with three related themes—mobility, seeding, and healing. Through traveling, different species and ideas are disseminated and hybridized. Through story-telling, the interference or concurrence of ideas, which are complicated with related socio-political values, are dramatized in a contested way. Through gardening, seeds of plants and ideas are planted, nurtured, inter-pollinated, domesticated, and absorbed into the local ecosystem and social milieu, impacting neighboring communities. Different kinds of gardens (kitchen garden, fruit garden, botanist garden, landscape garden) are managed with diverse gardening ideals, reflecting the diversity of cultures and mobilities. The ways of gardening of plants and of ideas demonstrate how sustainable ideas help to maintain sustainable communities endangered by colonial and capitalist exploitation.

In this novel, Silko focuses on the diasporic experiences of two indigenous young women, Sister Salt and Indigo. They are children of rape committed by irresponsible white men. Sister Salt is fathered by a Presbyterian preacher, while her sister Indigo is sired by an unnamed white. Both are raised by their grandmother, Grandma Fleet, a descendant of the fictional Sand Lizard tribe, modeled on the Sand Papago living in the south of Colorado River tribes (Snodgrass 130). Their acquaintance with other displaced individuals or ethnic groups and their encounters with whites during their displacement are situated at the time of the dispersion of Ghost Dance Religion and the Wounded Knee Massacre, the culminating event of Indian removal policies and practices. In the novel, Silko illustrates the historical background of Wounded Knee Massacre and its social and cultural impacts on Native Americans and other ethnic communities by chronicling the separate journeys of Sister Salt and Indigo. Mary Ellen Snodgrass notes that Silko "bases the event on a Ghost Dance held in Kingman, Arizona, in 1893, but for the sake of her story, she resets the gathering in Needles, California" (338).

The novel is divided into ten parts. The storylines are woven with two basic threads—Indigo's journey and Sister Salt's journey, which are linked to global indigenous diaspora and problems of inequity across national borders. The story begins with the 11-year-old Indigo's recollection of life in her Sand Lizard home land, a riverside sandy garden in southern Arizona, during the time of Ghost Dance fervor and US military intervention. When they are abducted by US officials, the two female protagonists start their separate journeys, and two storylines begin to move and develop in two directions. Sister Salt is sent to Parker Indian Reservation, Arizona, while Indigo is arranged to Sherman Institution in Riverside, California for forced Western education. Both run away from the imprisoning institutions and engage in different routes of traveling. After being recaptured by US official, Sister Salt is jailed in Yuma, north of Parker, where she forms a sisterhood of female survival with other ethnic women, including the Chemihueva-Laguana twins Maytha and Vedna. During imprisonment, she works as a laundry maid and a comfort girl to laborers on a dam project. Her sexual union with an Afro-Red Stick Indian cook and brewer, Big Candy, results in the birth of a son, called Bright Eyes. Sister Salt raises her son alone in Arizona, waiting for reunion with her younger sister. After Indigo run away from the boarding school, she intrudes into the fruit garden of Edward Palmer, a botanist, and Hattie Abbott, a retreated scholar of early Christian church history. The couple adopt Indigo and bring her on their grand tour to Europe. Both Sister Salt and Indigo encounter the dispersed followers of Ghost Dance during their journeys. At the near end, in Part Ten, the two storylines are rejoined with the recurring theme of the Ghost Dance. The two protagonists are finally reunited in their home land, and bring new seeds and hope to the old sand gardens. The repetitive references to Ghost Dance in the beginning, middle, and ending, form a circular pattern, which articulates both an indigenous ritual significance and a history of differentiated mobilities.

I. Traveling and Differentiated Mobilities

Sister Salt's and Indigo's journeys for survival and rejuvenation are rendered in the context of relocation of Native Americans and westward mobilization of whites. The building of a dam at Parker Canyon, Arizona, is a historical reference point. To store water for the newly located white population in California, the US government redirects waters of the Colorado River at Parker, Arizona, and builds a dam to supply water to Los Angeles. The construction of the dam at Parker Canyon not only causes uneven distribution of water resources but also displaces indigenous peoples and destroys riverbank ecology. On the one hand, it has created "water feud" between peoples on both sides of the Colorado River (Arizona and California) and militarization of that areas (211-12, 336-38). On the other hand, the relocation of white population to traditional Native American homelands or to the neighborhood of reservations forces the riverside indigenes to share rare resources with the newcomers or to move further away from their lands. The westward mobilization severely reduces the social spaces and mobility of the natives. When Sister Salt is captured and forced to move to the Parker reservation, she observes that the place is ugly, since too many tribal peoples are forced to live on rare resources by the river, while "[w]hite farmers claimed the best river bottom land" and the fertile portion of the reservation is "allotted to regular churchgoers; all the others were left to grow what they could, on land that was too far from the river to irrigate and too parched by the sun to grow much" (204). What is worse is that the accumulation of diasporic movement of Native Americans engenders a form of mobility feared by US government. Tim Cresswell illustrates in "The Production of Mobilities," that "movement is said to be, by some spatial science, 'dysfunctional', in so far as spatial structures are supposed to be organized in such a way as to minimize the need for movement" (Cresswell 2001, 327). The indigenous diasporic movement is regarded as dyfunctional, for it signifies a malfunction of social order and the danger of revolutionary upheaval.

In *On the Move: Mobility in the Modern Western World*, Tim Cresswell charts the ideological development of mobility from the medieval to the contemporary modern world. In the medieval feudal society, mobility was associated with insecurity and vagrancy, and "to be mobile in the Middle Age was to be without place, both socially and geographically" (11). Between the 17th century and 19th century, moment meant liberty and freedom and was regarded as an absolute human right, and tourism was regarded as an epitome of modernity (12-15). Whereas in high modernity, tension exists between spatialized ordering principle and sense of fluidity and mobility (16). In this novel, we can detect that the feudal conception and the liberal conception are articulated in the traveling narrative.

The events of Wounded Knee Massacre are situated at the milieu of the confrontation of population mobility. It begins with a new religious movement. In 1888, a Northern Paiute seer, Wovoka, initiated the Ghost Dance Religion to meet the urgent needs of hungry indigenous peoples ravaged by US policies of westward mobilization and the relocation and assimilation of Native Indians. Wovoka preached in a Christian Messiah manner and claimed that the world would soon end by a great flood, then come to be again. All things bad would be gone with the white people. The world would be reborn and all Native Americans, including the dead from past ages, would inherit the new earth, with lush prairie grasses and huge herds of buffalo. In order to earn this bright future life, Indians should live in harmony with Nature and avoid the white ways, especially alcoholism. To comfort the suffering, Indians should practice rituals, such as meditation, prayers, chanting, and a special "Ghost Dance," in which the dancers could supposedly meet their past relatives and have a glimpse of the future world (Waldman, *Encyclopedia* 233). In "Part One" of the novel, Wovoka informs the Indians that "If they danced the dance, then they would be able to visit their dear ones and beloved ancestors. The ancestor spirits were there to help them. . . . If they keep dancing, great storms would purify the Earth of her destroyers. The clear running water and the trees and the grassy plains filled with buffalo and elk would return" (Silko, *Gardens* 23). The new religious practice swept throughout much of the Western United States, and "spread to the conquered, destitute, and despondent people of the Far West, Southwest, and Great Plains" and even the resistant Sioux leaders Kicking Bear and Short Bull have travelled to Nevada to learn it (Waldman, *Atlas* 181). US officials, worried about religious fervor mixed with activism and insurgency, banned the Ghost Dance in November 1890 and started military threats against tribes that practiced it. The military action culminated at the event of massacre at Wounded Knee Creek on December 29, 1890 (Waldman, *Atlas* 181-82). In the novel, the popularity of the ghost dance rituals is perceived by the US government as dangerous mobility and the mobile people are regarded as a mob—"Federal officials feared the dancers were a secret army in disguise, ready to attack Needles" (Silko, *Gardens* 45).

Silko does not illustrate the Ghost Dance religious movement and indigenous resistance as singular events in the northern America, but as one stream among the current of world upheaval against colonialist and imperialist injustice and violence. In Edward's previous expedition toward the Caribbean Seas, he is informed "a recent uprising by half-castes and Indians who claimed to be guided the Indian Virgin of Guadalupe against the state collectors" in Tampico, Mexico (86). During the eastward journey to Europe, as Edward, Hattie, and Indigo approach Italy, the captain informs them that there are bandits and revolutionaries in the mountains of Corsica, their destination (271). As they arrive in Genoa, Italy, there is "news of the assassination of the Italian king only three days before, in Milan, by anarchists, to avenge the executions of their comrades. Victor Emmanuel III took the throne, but there were rumors of clashes between dissidents and police" (276). Through the acquaintance with Yaqui Gipsy woman Delena, Sister Salt learns about the peasant war against Mexican government. Delena steals the money in the labor camp owner Mr. Wylie's floor safe and runs to Tucson to buy "as many boxes of rifles and cartridges as she wanted" for the revolutionary cause (386).

Silko's novel weaves stories of traveling of different race, class, and gender, which highlight diverse mobilities of these people. Silko's deconstructive revision of sexist travel writing is done by contrasting ideas of movement *via* the testimonies of strong female characters, such as the two mixed blood Indians, Sister Salt and Indigo, the white woman Hattie, and the Yaqui woman Delena. Those strong females are rendered in contrast to the typical male travelers, such as Edward and Big Candy, for whom traveling is beneficial only for consolidating privileged social norms and values, and for accumulating capital and material gains.

Silko's rendering of the travel narrative illustrates multiple layers of spatial significance and global complexity. There is a contrast in the significance of the direction of movement. On the one hand, the white couple's (Hattie and Edward's) routes of the eastward journey—departing from the American south-west (California), traveling through Arizona, New Mexico, Kansas, Illinois, New York, crossing Atlantic Ocean to England, and then Italy track back the routes of European colonization on the American continent, and signify the uneven construction and distribution of mobility differentiated by racial, class, and gender differences. On the other hand, the significance of Sister Salt's and Indigo's cyclic journey—departing from the old gardens of American south-west, traveling through different places and landscapes, and then returning to the home land, not only through physically going back to the old gardens but also through repetitively evoking memories of the homeland and family during the process of journey—can be articulated with Silko's notions of "ritual circuit" and "interior landscape." In "Interior and Exterior Landscapes: The Pueblo Migration Stories," Silko asserts that the distance between the site of the natural springs at Paguate and the sandstone hilltop at Laguna, where she grew up, is an "interior distance" that cannot be measured by cartographical or archeological knowledge:

> The eight miles, marked with boulders, mesas, springs, and river crossings, are actually a *ritual circuit*, or path, that marks the *interior journey* the Laguna people made: a journey of awareness and imagination in which they emerged from being within the earth and all-included in the earth to the culture and people they became, differentiating themselves for the first time from all that had surrounded them, always aware that *interior distances* cannot be reckoned in physical miles or in calendar years.
>
> The narratives linked with prominent features of the landscape between Paguate and Laguna delineate the complexities of the relationship that human beings must maintain with the surrounding natural world if they hope to survive in this place. Thus, the journey was an interior process of the imagination, a growing awareness that being human is somehow different from all other life—animal, plant, and inanimate. (*Yellow Woman*, 37; my emphases.)

In *Gardens*, Silko depicts a complicated planetary movement of destruction and recovery in the form of crisscrossing of different mobilities.

Cultural geographers have defined mobility as socially produced motion (Urry, Cresswell, Massey). Doreen Massey points out that among different social groups, there is “power geometry” of social space and of mobility and “politics of mobility and access,” and she adds that “[d]ifferential mobility can weaken the leverage of the already weak. The time-space compression of some groups can undermine the power of others” (Massey 260). Silko demonstrates the collision of the feudal conception and the liberal conception of mobility through dramatizing two forms of mobility. For the privileged race, class, and gender, mobility is motivated by desire of domination over natural environment and exploitation of natural resources and the lands, places and social space of the disadvantaged race, class and gender. Such a dominating mobility is activated by law of relocation, mobilized by material desire for well-being and prosperity, facilitated by building public transportation systems and resource distribution systems, such as dam, and consolidated by militarization. For the underdogs, mobility is motivated by the need for survival through gathering and sharing resources, knowledge and spirit across different places. It is activated by traditional wisdom of local and ecological knowledge, and is mobilized by a collective awareness of resistance against unjust social distribution of space and resources, and against militarization. In time of crisis, the resistant mobility is fostered by channeling different routes of flight, sharing limited resources, and adopting strategies of the “trickster.” Privileged and dominating mobility is revealed through the stories of the male characters’ traveling. The sustaining and resistant mobility is revealed through the stories of diasporic experiences of female characters, especially of the mix-blood Sand Lizard sisters.

The white characters' movement concerns national and international networks of commerce and colonization, which are manipulated by mechanisms of socio-political power. The mixed-blood Indian characters' movement concerns the unpredictable, self-regulating, and self-generating flow of seed ideas, which are channeled though social infrastructure but are freely permuted and permeated through human conversation and interaction. The former is linear, while the latter is wavy. With the contrast between the linear movement of colonial exploitation, demonstrated by the male travelers, and the wavy line of flight, exemplified by the female travelers, we can figure out a hierarchy of social mobilities.

What is more interesting, and emphasized in Silko's emplotment, is not the preeminence of one movement over the other, but the crisscrossing of these two forms of mobility. The linear bodily and economical movements along the communication networks (train trails and stations, sea trails and ports) are interspersed with the wavy bodily and spiritual activities in diverse gardens and places. Silko depicts the pitfalls of colonial exploitative progress along the linear networks that motivate the wavy lines of flight of diasporic ethnic groups and resistant individuals. Silko's *Gardens* is not just a story of Indigo's spiritual progress and social growth, as many critics (such as Joy Porter) have interpreted, but a network of stories about diverse mobilities. Silko depicts the pitfalls of environmental and cultural devastation mobilized by the colonialists' linear trajectories through the eyewitness of diasporic groups and strong females (Adamson 11). She rehistoricizes the flagship events of the Ghost Dance Religion and the Wounded Knee Massacre by tracing the confrontation of the two mobilities and its vehement effects left on the Americas and Europe.

Sister Salt's storyline of diasporic experience in the American south-west and the U.S.-Mexico border areas highlights the collision with two other movements (Big Candy's capitalist itinerary and Delena's revolutionary mission), and it contrasts two concepts of mobility (mobility as freedom and mobility as resistance). Unlike his Baton Rough (Red Stick) Indian grandma, who distrusts the churchgoer (209), and his African slave mother, who regards herself as a free woman (217), Big Candy panders to white culture and capitalist greed. Doing his utmost to climb the social ladder, he applies his culinary skills as well as other moneymaking tricks in exploiting the dam workers, including running places for laundry, gambling, and prostitution. Born a Yaqui Indian, Delena is a victim of Mexican militarization in an indigenous area, where her parents are killed. She is presumed dead among indigenous dead bodies by Mexican soldiers, and is rescued by traveling Gypsies. Later, she joins the peasant war against the Mexican government and utilizes the techniques learned from the Gypsies, such as tarot reading and dog training, and other tricks to collect funds and armory for the resistant guerrilla mission.

Big Candy's dream to build his own restaurant in Denver is shattered when the money saved from his and Sister Salt's labors is stolen by Delena. This can be interpreted as a collateral damage of militarization of peasant revolution across U.S.-Mexico border. Delena does not steal the money for her personal desire but for funding the Yaqui peasants to fight against the Mexican federal troops (354, 420). The Yaqui, or Yoeme, originally dwelt in Yaqui River valley, with a cultural focus on agriculture and trading throughout north Sonora (of Mexico) and south Arizona (US). Since the 16th century, the Yaqui had been resisting Spanish and Mexican rule. In the 1880s, as the Mexican government began to deport Yaqui to work on plantations in Yucatán (2,000 miles away from their traditional homeland), or to scatter them across Mexico and into the U.S. The Yaqui resisted these relocation policies by escaping and engaging in guerrilla warfare (Waldman 270-71, Luna-Firebaugh 167). Delena's story is an episode in the Yaqui resistance scenarios, which parallel American Indian resistance storylines, exemplified by the stories of the two Sand Lizard sisters. Analyzing the repeated reference of ethnic conflict and war in *Gardens*, Snodgrass observes that "[t]he image of a peasant war against an institutionalized militia repeat from *Almanac of the Dead* Silko's defense of the underclass who fight for their rights" (Snodgrass 328).

Silko's defense of the underclass is revealed through Sister Salt's understanding of other indigenous women's mobilities or resistance efforts. Before Sister Salt meets Delena, she has formed an alliance with other ethnic women, especially the Chemihueva-Laguana twins Maytha and Vedna, who accompany her while she is in labor and return to the old gardens with her. As she meets the Gypsy tarot reader, Sister Salt is informed that Mexican soldiers kill every captive, even women and children, and she deduces, "War explained the scar down her [Delena's] face; war answered the question of whether she had any family" (354). She does not blame Delena for stealing her money, for she sympathizes with Delena and attributes her betrayal to the "war that sent her their direction," whereas she doubts Big Candy's loyalty. Even if he catches up with Delena and gets back the money, she doubts that "she would ever see him again" (398). For her, the only consolation is to return to the old gardens. As she returns to the old gardens and reunites with Indigo, Delena successfully completes her mission to purchase rifles in Tucson and ship them to Hermosillo, Mexico. Delena believes that the resistance will go on and the indigenes will outlast the colonizers as they always have (462). Big Candy is not able to sympathize with Delena, another underdog like him. His unrelenting pursuit of Delena is motivated by the capitalist idea of mobility as capital and the use of capital to buy more access to mobility. The motivation of Big Candy's mobility is like that of egotistic botanist Edward Palmer, and his fellow bio-pirate Mr. Eliot, which is revealed through Indigo's story. The problems associated with the unjust distribution of resources and the risk of building the dam at Parker, Arizona to redirect waters of Colorado River to Los Angeles, California, as shown in Big Candy's involvement, parallel the colonial exploitation of indigenous resources and sacred sites through bio-piracy, exemplified by the efforts of Edward Palmer, who works as a bio-pirate for Lowe & Company (128).

Through Indigo's storyline of traveling across state and national borders, we can observe that the colonial and capitalist travel industry and the ongoing development of transportation mechanisms are complicit with the encroachment of indigenous living place and sacred site. Before Edward Palmer marries Hattie Abbot, he has been involved in bio-piracy for private collectors, Lowe & Company and U.S. and British governments, for more than twenty years (128). During 1893, before Indigo's diasporic journey leads her to associate with the Palmer family, Edward has already engaged in a trans-national bio-theft, commissioned by U.S. Department of Agriculture in cooperation with officials of the Kew Gardens (the British Royal Botanic Gardens) to obtain disease-resistant specimens of rubber tree seedlings from their original place, the Para River in Brazil, in order to resist and survive the leaf blight found in the British colonial plantations in the Far East (129). The rationale for this trans-national enterprise is that, without the disease-resistant rubber trees in the plantations, "the supplies of cheap natural rubber would be lost to England and the United States; Brazil would enjoy a world monopoly of rubber once more" (129). After Henry Wickham successfully "smuggle[s] seventy thousand rubber tree seeds past Brazilian customs officers to break Brazil's monopoly of natural rubber" (129) and brings them to Botanical Gardens at Kew in 1876, Brazilian government would arrest any foreigner found in possession of rubber tree seeds or seedlings (130). This time, Edward's clandestine itinerary is more dangerous than other expeditions because of the Brazilian government's supervision and the raids among competitors.

The direct effect of this colonial competition and bio-theft is the devastation of indigenous livelihood and natural environment. During this expedition, Edward is informed of the violent history of a rubber station at Portal, where an Indian village used to stand. The rubber station at Portal "was infamous for the use of torture and killing to increase the output of the indentured Indians who gathered the wild rubber," and with the periodic raids and reprisal raids originated from competition among rubber buyers "dozens of Indians and white and Negro were killed" (133). From this expedition, Edward earns nothing except a handicapped leg, burned by a jungle fire intentionally started by Mr. Eliot, his colleague from Lowe & Company, who wishes to make sure their company possesses the only specimens of *Laelia cinnabarina* by burning its natural habitat. But a monkey survives from previous massacre at the rubber station and helps to rescue Edward.

In reflecting upon his expedition to the Para River, Edward understands he is used as a decoy in the service of Lowe & Company and its associated U.S. and British government officers; however, he does not restrain his involvement in bio-piracy. Worse, using the former experience of betrayal as an example, he organizes a grand tour to Europe with his newly-wed wife Hattie and the newly adopted Indian girl Indigo. Using his travel companies as decoys, Edward plans to steal potentially profitable citrus grafts from Bostia, Corsica. Like the result of his former bio-theft expedition, Edward is arrested in Livorno, Italy by custom officers for stealing citrus grafts. He disregards his wife and adopted daughter, who suffer a brief detention at the U.S. embassy in Livorno. Immediately after release from jail, Edward jumps into a mining venture at Arizona meteor site proposed by a phony Australian doctor, Dr. Gates, who convinces him that the site contains "threads of pure silver and gold" and "black diamonds" (374). Edward persuades Hattie and his sister to lend him money to purchase the mining deed. His family does not respond, but Hattie "generously arranged a line of credit for him at her bank" (401). The meteor crate site turns out to be an Indian burial site. The official document of meteorites records about "a three-thousand-pound meteor iron discovered in Indian ruins in northern Chihuahua in a room with human burials, wrapped in native cotton" (403). After examining the burial objects with the meteorites, he and Dr. Gates are not aware of their desecration of the Indian sacred site, for they are attracted by "tons and tons more of diamond-bearing iron waited for them there" (*ibid.*). As Edward descends to the crater, his broken leg regains pain with redness and swelling around the scar (*ibid.*). His leg pain does not remind him of his former failed expedition to the Pará River, nor the betrayal of his business partner. Just like a rude tourist would do with an indigenous sacred site, he proudly writes to Hattie about what he has discovered in the mining site, "the 'baby,' or meteor iron, wrapped in layers of feather blanket, wore a tiny necklace and matching bracelet of tiny beads. Funeral offerings of food and a toy whistle were carefully arranged in the stone cavity with the meteor iron" (413). Soon after reading the letters, Hattie has a foreboding nightmare, and the next day she is informed that her husband is hospitalized. Edward dies very soon by the wrong diagnosis and experimental treatments of Dr. Gates, his treacherous business partner. Before he dies, he does not feel regretful for what he has done to his wife and other people, for him "Livorno, even Hattie and the separation, would scarcely matter beside the wall of silver and gold," and his only regret is that he has not bribed the customs officers in Livorno (426).

On the return trip to Riverside by train, Hattie reflects that her travel experience with Edward is like the Christian descriptions of hell and purgatory, which she no longer believes but relocates them "here on earth" (374). More surprisingly, after Edward's funeral, she finds she is cheated again by Edward, who has over-drawn her bank account to purchase the mining claim and equipments (440). To reclaim her loan from Edward's investment, Hattie's lawyer suggests that she investigate the mine site personally. She is robbed and raped on her way back from the investigation, and is found "wandering naked and dazed beside the road near Topock, at the northern edge of the Chemehuevi reservation" (456). She is rescued and cared for by Indian women during the time of physical recovery. During the police investigation, she discovers the townspeople protect one another by lying to the deputy, who would leave the case open for one year. Associating this unjust investigation with her failed thesis debate in Boston, she feels so frustrated that "she could never return to her former life among the lies. She had to leave at once" (459). As she is penniless and placeless, it is Indigo that provides her a shelter in the old gardens; and it is the Ghost Dance ritual introduced by Sister Salt and Indigo that helps to heal her psychologically and spiritually. We see a wonderful circulation of female energy and spirit from the relation between Hattie and Indigo, for on the way to Europe, it is Hattie that shares social space with Indigo, so that the mix-blood Indian girl may expand her world view and mobility, collect seeds for the old gardens, and learn more ways of gardening.

For the male travelers, such as Big Candy and Edward Palmer, traveling mobility offers them access to exploit lucrative objects from the other places. Their eyes focus only on the exotic and capital values of the human and nonhuman objects. For the female travelers, traveling mobility provides them chances to encounter and exchange different perspective on the mobile world. For the two Sand Lizard sisters, traveling is to find routes for dwelling, and to learn more ways of gardening. For Hattie, traveling mobility provides her channels to link to the expanding resources of female spirituality through other strong women. For Delena, traveling mobility signifies not only the routes of flight but also access to resistance.

With the dramatization of the collision of two forms of mobility, Silko interweaves Indigo's and Sister Salt's stories of captivity, survival, and triumphant return with the traditional stories told at Laguna Pueblo about the travels of Kochininako (Yellow Woman)[1] who was not afraid to "cross traditional boundaries during time of crisis" to save the people (Silko, *Yellow Woman* 70). Both Indigo's and Sister Salt's cyclic journeys, moving eastward and back, contain ritual significance in the Cochiti and Laguna Pueblo Indian tradition. Silko indicates that, in her Laguna Pueblo tradition, the name "Yellow Woman" refers to the ritual color of the east (*Yellow Woman* 71), which represents the renewal of life in the Medicine Wheel or Circle of Life. The scenarios of the Ghost Dance ritual, which are depicted with significant details in the beginning (Part One, 26-27) and at the near end of the novel (Part Ten, 462-680), constitute a ritual circle and parallel with the circular journeys of Sister Salt and Indigo. The thematic association with Yellow Woman narrative is apparent at the end of Part Nine. After Sister Salt returns to the old gardens with her baby and the Chemihueva-Laguana twins, reflecting on the betrayal of Delena and abandonment of Big Candy, she does not regret her loss nor feels shameful for her sale of sex, as she recalls the "River Girl character in the old stories the twins heard at Laguna"—"The River Girl walks with Whirlwind Man and the poor receive venison and deer hide; when she goes off with Buffalo Man during a famine, the buffalo agree to give the starving humans their meat" (400). One night after Indigo returns to their homeland and reunites with Sister Salt, the two sisters sit in the old garden and look at the North Star in the starry sky and recall Grandma Fleet's story about Arrow Boy who, under the guide of the North Star, brings back his wife Yellow Woman, who has run away with Buffalo Man (417).

---

[1] In "Evil Kachina Steals Yellow Woman," Kochininako was abducted by Evil Kachina to the east. She survived for her resilient adaptability to the new environment and changing situations. When she was

In her essay "Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit," Silko recalls two of her favorite stories of Yellow Woman. In one version, she is taken away by Buffalo Man, who can transform from human to buffalo. She falls in love with him, and because of their intimate relationship, the Buffalo People agrees to sacrifice their bodies to the hunters to feed the starving people. In another version, Yellow Woman has a liaison with Whirlwind Man, and returns to her husband ten months later with two boy babies, who will become great heroes of her clan (*Yellow Woman* 71). Silko emphasizes the courage and uninhibited sexuality of Yellow Woman and remarks that "Kochininako is beautiful because she has the courage to act in times of great peril, and her triumph is achieved by her sensuality, not through violence and destruction" (72). As in the traditional storyline of Yellow

---

rescued by her husband and grandmother Old Spider Woman, she was pregnant with a child by the Evil Kachina. The child was accepted by her clan without any resentment (Allen 211-15). In "Sun Steals Yellow Woman," Kochininako was kidnapped by the Sun to the place "where the sun comes up." When she was rescued by her husband Shell Man, grandmother, and a Whirlwind Man, and returned to her tribe, she had a child by the Sun, who will became the chief of her people. See Paula Gunn Allen, ed.. *Spider Woman's Granddaughters: Traditional Tales and Contemporary Writing by Native American Women*, 217-18.

Woman, Sister Salt returns to the old garden with a boy baby, who she calls "little black grandfather" (344) or "little black spider baby" (351) and two indigenous women, Martha and Vedna, whereas Indigo returns to the old garden with seeds of plants. Both of them return to their tribal land with seed-thoughts and experiences to cultivate their land and sustain their culture.

Different from many Native American novelists who use mixed blood characters to articulate the problems of ambivalent identities and mimicry in contemporary Native American society, in this novel Silko focuses on two Yellow Woman "types," Sister Salt and Indigo, to track the roots of cultural and environmental problems as well as to search for routes to a sustainable future—one through interracial "inter-course" in America, the other though interracial discourses across national borders. During their dispersal in different places, they do not have problems in their identity and sense of belonging. Their adoptability to alien places and friendly links to strangers by sharing stories and resources help to enrich their tribal memory, and create a diasporic subject built not on possession of property but on memories of places, which "may be place-based, but they are not necessarily place-bound" (Fortier 184).

In light of the spirit of "Yellow Women" stories, we may understand Silko's scale of morality in depicting betrayal in *Gardens*. In the Sister Salt-Big Candy-Delena scenario, Silko validates Delena's trickery over Big Candy's betrayal in that Delena risks her own life to foster the noble cause of peasant revolution. Similarly, in the Indigo-Hattie-Edward plot, Silko justifies Indigo's version of plant theft over Edward's bio-piracy. When Edward is arrested, the custom authorities confiscates all the twig cutting but pardons Indigo's sacks of gladiolus corms and envelopes of seeds collected from Aunt Bronwyn and Professor Laura (370). The rationale is that Indigo collects flower seeds and gladioulus corms to enrich the old sandy gardens, which can be shared by the others, whereas Edward steals lucrative plants for personal profit.

Silko provides a bigger map of the dominating mobility in the old Europe. The colonial space of inequity is vividly illustrated through Aunt Bronwyn's association of the development of port city with slave market:

> "No greater English port city was without its slave market." The slave market in Bristol had been one point of the golden triangle of world trade. Ships sailed out of Bristol Harbor with English textiles, tin, and glass for the coast of West Africa, where the goods were traded for slaves; in the Americas the slaves were traded for cargoes of tobacco and cotton, which were transported back to Bristol, where the golden cycle repeated itself. (231)

When Hattie and Indigo returns from the European journey, Hattie accompanies Indigo to the old gardens. On the train, Indigo calls Hattie's attention to the damage of the dam construction to the environment—"the river was stripped, and only a narrow stream, muddy red, flowed south. The river was stripped naked; all its willows and tamarisks were gone, its red clay banks scraped; and exposed piles of white skeletons of cottonwood trees dotted the swaths of scraped red earth" (394). After Indigo returns to the old gardens, she is able to associate the devastation of natural environments and encroachments of indigenous living place with the deprived mobility of the indigenes:

> Before the government drew the reservation lines, there was plenty for everyone to eat because the people used to roam up and down the river for hundreds of miles to give the plants and animals a chance to recover. But now the people were restricted to the reservations, so everyone foraged those same few miles of river. (414)

II. Gardening Ideas across Borders: Sustainability in the Mobile World

Three landmarks of earth summit on sustainability, the Brundtland Report (1987), the Rio Declaration of UNCED and Agenda 21 (1992), the Johannesburg Declaration of WSSD (2002), highlight three core concerns for a sustainable future—the interrelated three Es—Ecology/Environment, Economy/Employment, and Equality/Equity. As Andrews R. Edwards points out, the three Es have, for millennia, been prevailed in the practices of Australian Aborigines as "songlines" and "Way of the Law" or the "Footprints of Ancestors," which "[provide] both a land ethic and a compass for connecting in a harmonious way with the land and their communities, current and past" (Edwards 26). Edwards proposes to add "educational model" as the fourth "E" principle. One would easily observe that these principles are also applicable and available in other indigenes, including Native Americans. This implies that what emerges as a paradigm shift to "the sustainability revolution" (Edwards), with an economical awareness of the "natural capital" (Hawken, *Natural*) and "deep economy" (McKibben), and a growing grass-root affiliation of "blessed unrest" in environmental and social justice movement (Hawken, *Blessing*), can be substantiated with educational models (the fourth E) from the oral traditions of the indigenes.

These sustainable principles are dramatized wonderfully in Silko's novel, *Gardens in the Dunes*. Gardening demonstrates an exemplar stewardship of the land, which is dramatized deliberately in Silko's novel through weaving the themes of gardening and story-telling with that of traveling, in a network of differentiated mobilities in a mobile world. The diasporic experiences of the two Yellow Women not only demonstrate the problems caused by dominating mobility but also illustrate the diverse ways to deal with the problems through the action of gardening, which emphasizes sharing resources and responsibilities to the environment and other sustainable principles.

A garden, no matter its size, style, or function, is a tranquil place in the mobile world. A garden provides a perspective for travelers to appreciate the beauty of landscape. The enclosed space with diverse paths and species of plants invites the visitors to walk slowly and look closely at the beings in the world. At times, it may inspire the walkers to reflect themselves and the significance of differences in the changing world. Gardening is to practice one's way of dwelling. Different from traveler, a gardener only takes what one needs at the moment of gardening. When one takes care of the garden one may feel he/she is being cared for. One returns what one learns from the garden to the garden. Against the movement of currencies, people and objects, the gardener feels the circulation of energy and spirit among the beings, the earth, the air, and the sky. For these reasons, a garden is an invaluable and open classroom to learn and practice principles of tranquility and sustainability.

In this novel, Silko integrates the themes of traveling and gardening by making the travelers, especially the strong female characters, encounter different kinds and styles of gardens during their traveling itinerary. The diverse kinds of gardens (kitchen garden, fruit garden, botanist garden, landscape garden) are managed with contesting gardening ideals and related economical and ethical attitudes.

Equality/Equity in the Old Gardens

For the Sand Lizard women, gardening, which requires intense bodily responsibility to and aesthetic sensibility of the land and plants, is an important management measure for environmental recovery. The works in the indigenous old gardens are proceeded with mutual respect and responsibility between human-beings and non-human beings—"Each person had plants to care for, although the harvest was shared by everyone. Individual plants had pet names-Bushy, Fatty, Skinny, Shorty, Mother, and Baby were common names" (16). Such works are done with a prospect of sustaining both the people and the land. Grandma Fleet teaches her children the principle of sharing—the first ripe fruit of each plant is presented to the spirits of the ancestors, who appear as rain, the second serve is for birds and animals, to thank for their restraint in sparing the seeds, and a selected portion of the harvest are left untouched to let the plants reseed in the natural way (15). According to Grandma Fleet, to reseed in the natural way is the right way to replenish the land—"Old Sand Lizard insisted her gardens be reseeded in that way because human beings are undependable;

they might forget to plant at the right time or they might not be alive next year" (*ibid.*). Such a natural way of gardening guarantees the plenitude and replenishment of the land, and in time of crisis, may provide shelter for hungry people—"[i]n a time of emergency, the old gardens could be counted on for sanctuary" (15). Grandma Fleet's words are testified by the social underdogs mobilized before and after Ghost Dance movement and U.S. government militarization. Her observation—"the old gardens had always been there" (*ibid.*) will be verified by Sister Salt's and Indigo's returning journey.

For Winona LaDuke, an distinguished American Indian (Ojibwe) writer and Executive Director of Honor the Earth, the recovery of indigenous people is related to the recovery of the traditional food system. In "Food as Medicine: The Recovery of Traditional Foods to Heal the People," LaDuke illustrates how contemporary "indigenous communities are recovering agricultural traditions linking past to present and future—and in the process, restoring spiritual practices related to foods, while strengthening community health and self-determination" (191). She chooses the example of Tohono O'odham (Papago) people to demonstrate how "food is medicine." The Papago people live between Phoenix, Arizona and the north of the Mexican border, in the wide area of the Sonora Desert—Silko's fictional Sand Lizard could be their close neighbors or relatives. The diversity of food plants in the desert used to provide a diverse and healthy diet for the people. Like the Sand Lizard people, "after a century of land usurpation and irrigation projects removing water from their territories for the creation of urban areas like Phoenix and Tucson, the O'odham capacity to be nutritionally self-sufficient and food secure was dramatically impaired" (200). A non-profit organization Native Seeds/SEARCH helps them to rediscover that their traditional foods may protect them from high sugar level and diabetes. Once they are initiated, they organize a Tohono O'odham Community Action (TOCA) to spread the good news and share experiences to return to the old gardens (201-2). LaDuke concludes that "[t]he recovery of the [American Indian] people is tied to the recovery of food, since food itself is medicine—not only for the body but also for the soul and for the spiritual connection to history, ancestors and the land" (210).

In "Coming Home to Eat: Re-imagining Place in the Age of Global Climate Change," ecocritic Joni Adamson argues that the recovery of traditional food system benefits both human and environmental health. She relates the struggles of Sister Salt and Indigo to survive in the "one of the largely unexamined consequences of colonization" and their persistence practice of subsistence gardening to the fight for "food sovereignty" (11).[2]

---

[2] In "Farmers Feeding Families: Agroecology in South Central Los Aangeles," Devon Peña defines

Gardening is also a valuable resource for psychological healing. Sustainable gardening incurs spiritual influences on the inhabitants in that the gardeners share a land-based spirituality in which they feel identified with and responsible to the plants, animals, clouds, and their ancestors (28). The spirits among all beings, in the reflection of Sister Salt, "let me know how beautiful we are, how beautiful we will become" (28). During the diasporic journey of Indigo, collecting new seeds of flowers and trees empowers the lonely girl, for such an activity associates with the life-sustaining and love-inspiring gardening of her grandma and clan (176). With the self-imposed seed-collecting mission in mind, she then perceives the estranged experience as an extended homeward journey. When she is lonely, she seeks comfort by talking to the ocean, "Please help me, Ocean! Send your rainy wind to my sister with this message: I took the long way home, but I'm on my way. Don't worry" (224). Similarly, during her work as washer of laundry and comfort woman to laborers on the dam site project, Sister Salt sustains her spirit by caring for wild plants and flowers and creating her own garden in her new living place (212-13).

Hattie's frustrated search for female spirituality is restored by linking to broader female endeavors in the old gardens in Old Europe—in her aunt Browyn's gardens in Bath, England, and in her aunt's friend Laura's gardens in Lucca, Italy. In addition, as I have discussed previously, she is rescued by Indian women to the old gardens, and her psychological trauma is healed through the Ghost Dance ritual.

Traveling affords Indigo chances to perceive contesting ideas of gardening. When Indigo escapes from Indian School and runs into Edward's and Hattie's house in Riverside, California, she is amazed at the various kinds of gardens, "the sunny gardens, the shady gardens, the damp gardens, the water gardens" (84), and she wonders at the unsustainable use of water for those gardens in a desert region, "Where did they get all the water? The land here was sandy desert nearly as dry as home" (84). Indigo's eyewitness brings the readers to Edward's botanic garden. The laboratory work of Edward, under the tutelage of his apathetic father, is alienated from his family as well as from the natural beings (90-91). Edward's scientific attitude toward the plants keeps spirituality at bay. For him, it is the insatiable desire for capital gain that motivates his botanical lab works and justifies his involvement in colonialist endeavors to collect or steal lucrative plant species (79, 85). His botanic lab work and his bio-theft can not be regarded as gardening.

"food sovereignty" as the relationship "between people and the plants they cultivate understood as a pathway to their own wholesome identity as a people and community in place" (qtd. in Adamson 10).

In Part Four, Edward and Hattie bring Indigo to sojourn in their relatives' houses in Oyster Bay, New York, where they visit many European landscape gardens. Edward's sister, Susan James and her Husband Collins James have bought an Italian-Renascence-style old house, which is built near the house of Mr. Abbot, Hattie's father. Susan is passionate in renovating the Renaissance-style gardens into English landscape gardens. Her reason is that "she found the arrangement of shrubs and trees according to their hues of green artificial and boring; the geometric topiary forms were ridiculous. She wants a natural garden filled with color—an English landscape garden with swaths of flowers in all colors from the bright to the shade" (186). However, Edward prefers the original Italian style, for those Italian gardens "were so intimate and refined, so secure from intrusion" (190), and he regards her sister's renovation as foolish. Susan's preference for the English landscape gardens reveals a female awareness against male gaze and dominance, and a quest for privacy and freedom in the irregular composition and open space.

The formal closure of Renaissance-style gardens is implicit with the hierarchical principle of religious, social, and gender order in the story of Garden of Eden (Merchant, *Reinventing*). Compared with the Italian and French counterparts, the style of English landscape garden, developed from the aesthetic of the picturesque, affords the visitors with more freedom and privacy by using irregular design, open spatial composition, and an abundance of "wild" plants. However, such an ideal of free, private, and wild space is framed in the elite "picturesque" models, established by European male painting masters, such as Claude Lorrain (1600-82) and Salvator Rosa (1615-73). Behind such a framing is a transformed sense of superiority and hierarchy. In "Transplantation of the Picturesque: Emma Hamilton, English Landscape, and Redeeming the Picturesque," Shin-ichi Anzai traces the implicit social and gender politics in the aesthetic of the picturesque and the English landscape garden. Anzai asserts that the aesthetic of the Picturesque

> involves both assimilation and dissimilation, superiority and inferiority, violence and healing, and their inversion. This is because the Picturesque is a transplantation of a familiar, established formula on to the Other, making homogeneity and heterogeneity emerge in the same instance. (69)

We can detect a vivid example of such a dialectic of superiority and inferior, enclosure and freedom in Susan's renovation of the Renaissance gardens.

When Indigo encounters Aunt Bronwyn's kitchen gardens in Bath, England, she is impressed by its extensiveness of space, variety of plants and flowers, diversity of styles, and embedded layers of soil and local history (240). The exotic variety of food plants attract both Hattie and Indigo. Aunt Bronwyn's kitchen gardens are exemplars of the sustainable farming in the Old Europe. Aunt Bronwyn has gathered food plants from all over the world—"from the Americas, tomatoes, potatoes, pumpkins, squash, and sweet corn; and garlic, onions, broad beans, asparagus, and chickpeas from Italy—grew with peppers from Asia and Africa" (240). She claims that a garden should be loved in order to grow properly, and she attests the theories of Gustav Fechner, "who believed plants have souls and human beings exist only to be consumed by plants and be transformed into glorious new plant life" (*ibid.*). Aunt Bronwyn's gardening enlightens Indigo to associate seed-collecting with sharing gardening ideas. She becomes aware that "the trip had been a wonderful opportunity for gardening ideas—Indigo had a small valise full of carefully folded wax paper packets with the seeds she'd gathered" (*ibid.*).

Both Hattie and Indigo prefer these old gardens to the English landscape gardens and the Masque of Blue Garden transplanted from Europe to the Americas. In the last sojourn of the eastward travel to Old Europe, as Indigo visits Aunt Bronwyn's friend in Lucca, Italy, Indigo encounters the familiar food plants of her homeland, red peppers and yellow squash, in a distant foreign land, and proclaimed "seeds must be among the greatest travelers of all" (291). Indigo associates her long journey with that of the seeds. Indigo's transnational traveling and the global dissemination of seeds could be perceived as an integral part of the "interior journey" of the planet.

Grandma Fleet's teaching about natural reseeding, Indigo's seed-collecting project and Aunt Bronwyn's efforts in gathering food plants all over the world are in line with the contemporary environmental efforts of germplasm preservation through establishing gene banks and preserving natural habitats, especially the "Vavilov Center," or center for the beginning of agriculture. All the narrative settings of the old gardens in the Americas and Old Europe coincide with the "Vavilov Center."

Immunity and Community

To read the travel narrative along with the gardening narrative in this novel as an unified interior journey of the Tree of Life, and the travelers and gardeners as the cells and saps circulate in the tree, reminds us of the emergent global grass-root movement to recover environmental integrity and social justice. Unlike traditional social movements, which are characterized by strong leaders and shared ideological or religious beliefs, the growing grass-root affiliation of "blessed unrest" in environmental and social justice movement is "a massive enterprise undertaken by ordinary citizen everywhere, not by self-appointed governments or oligarchies" (Hawken, *Blessing* 5). Hawken compares the coherent mass of uncontrolled movement to protect, repair, and restore the endangered natural and social environment to the "immune system, which operates independently of an individual person's intent" (141). "The immune system is the most diverse system in the body, consisting of an array of proteins, immunoglobulins, monocytes, macrophages, and more, a micro bestiary of cells working in synch with one another" (142), whose function is directed by "a network of *immunological memory*, a store of knowledge that rivals the capacities of our brain" (142). Such a web of knowledge, or a "Tree of Knowledge", is deemed by many Native American cultures as wisdom of Selu (Corn-Mother).

A holistic "Tree of Life" and "Tree of Knowledge" are incorporated into diverse stories of the story of Selu (Corn-Mother). The storyline includes Selu's identity of corn, her grandsons' disrespect, the consequence of it, and Selu's teachings concerning how they could restore the harmony for themselves and for the good of the people (Awikta 10-14). The cyclic themes—the gift of Selu, the disrespect of Selu, and the cyclic pattern of wound, healing, and return—are framed in the four directions of a medicine wheel. For Marilou Awiakta, the story designed by indigenous people to "create a synapse in the mind, a lens in the eye, a drum in the ear, a rhythm in the heart" chronicles the natural way of corn, "strength, respect, balance, harmony," and its wisdom of "adaptability, cooperation, unity in diversity" (9).

Awiakta asserts that "[s]even thousand years of concentrated energy emanate from the seed" which is "coded with ways of growing" (18), and that from the "spirit" or the "nature of the corn," the followers of Selu "learn survival wisdoms, common-sense ways of living in harmony with their environment and with each other" (19). The spirit of a seed is decoded and communicated through storytelling—"Each story is itself a seed, where the spirit of corn, as well as her basic teachings, in concentrated. . . . Story and life interweave. Like the grain, the stories vary from tribe to tribe, but the spirit is the same" (19). John Kruger, an Okanagan medicine man and Elder explains the value and function of a seed-story that "What the story does is speak in the present and bring the past forward, so we can have a future" (Awikta 208).

By linking "gardening" with "interior journey," one can envision the planet as a Tree of Life and the synergy of diverse local knowledge of subsistence and sustainability as a Tree of Knowledge. This aspect is revealed by Indigo's self-imposed mission of collecting seeds during her travelling. Each seed in her collection contains local ecological knowledge of cultivation, including sowing, planting, cross-pollination, crop rotation, and companion planting with other seeds (416). Each seed also contains memory of a place and the people who share with the knowledge and its related culture (416-17). When Indigo planted the flower seeds brought from European gardens, the other indigenous females question Indigo about the values of them, but later they found the gladiolus were not only beautiful but also tasty (476). The memory of a seed may bring the harvest for the future.

Sustainable Partnership and Pollination of Seed-Thoughts

In *Gardens*, each traveler is depicted as a capsule of cultural ideas and local knowledge. Edward's capsule is full of scientific knowledge and materialist desire, and it is impermeable and can't be replenished. Indigo's capsule and Hattie's capsule are relatively spacious. They exchange stories and share emotional responses, which can be inter-pollinated and transformed into seed-thought to be planted in the future. For example, encountering goddess artifacts in diverse gardens offers them chances to recall and then to share different cultural stories about female spirituality. For Hattie, the stories about the coming into being and transformation of the goddess statutes and figurines of the Old Europe are origin (creation) stories of female spirituality; for Indigo, they are alternative versions of emergence stories of "Grandmother" in Native American traditions. After the related cultural ideas are inter-pollinated in their exchange of stories, a trans-continent, trans-national idea of ancient matrilineal, land-based cultures emerges. It is the awareness of such an inter-pollination of female principles and ecological partnership that change Hattie's attitude toward Indigo from guardianship to a sisterhood of survival and resistance.

The subtlety of Silko's deconstruction of traditional male travel writing and colonist geopolitical imagination of mobility lies in the conversion of Hattie from a sexist accomplice to an integral woman capable of caring for herself and the others. Before that conversion, Hattie is a victim of religious bigotry and an accomplice of male chauvinism. Hattie's submission is complementary to Edward's irresponsibility in his exploitative exploration. Hattie's conversion is processed by inter-pollination of different ideas about gardening and spirituality through diverse conversations with Indigo, Aunt Bronwyn, and Professor Laura. The Sand Lizard sisters' "Yellow Woman" scenario is connected and compared with Hattie's search for female spirituality in Christianity and aunt Bronwyn's and Professor Laura's practices of sustainable partnership principles found in the goddess artifacts of Old Europe.

The sexist and colonialist attitudes, featured by most male characters and their related mobilities in *Gardens*, can be traced to two Anglo-European seed-thoughts of dominator model, the ideas of the "Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil" and the "Tree of Life" in Christian myth. Discourses engendered from such seed-thoughts condition gender role and propel an antagonistic model of subjectivity, and such a mode of thinking belittles gardening as a secondary and feminine activity and distorts travelling as primarily a male endeavor.

The conception of the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil and the Tree of Life in the myth of Garden of Eden anticipates the concept of monoculture and European formal landscape gardens. The Garden of Eden, with its abundance of substance food plants and beauty, is rendered as enclosed, and privileged for the selected. The fruit from the "Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil" is forbidden so that it can further guard against human access to the "Tree of Life" in the garden.

The narrative of the Garden of Eden, with its diverse variation and interpretations, affords Western cultural imagination to link all the best possible worlds in one origin, and to regard the planet as a garden. In *Reinventing Eden: the Fate of Nature in Western Culture*, Carolyn Merchant has uses such a "planet as a garden" trope and extends it to elaborate different scenarios of "Recovery of Eden."

> The Garden of Eden story has shaped Western culture since earliest times and the American world since the 1600s. We have tried to reclaim the lost Eden by reinventing the entire earth as a garden. . . . The Recovery of Eden story is the mainstream narrative of Western culture. It is perhaps the most important mythology humans have developed to make sense of their relationship to the earth. Internalized by Europeans and Americans alike since the seventeenth century, this story has propelled countless efforts by humans to recover Eden by turning wilderness into garden, "female" nature into civilized society, and indigenous folkways into modern culture. Science, technology, and capitalism have provided the tools, male agency the power and impetus. Today's incarnations of Eden are the suburb, the mall, the clone, and the World Wide Web. (2)

The narrative of "Recovery of Eden" is a handy discursive trope in Western imagination, but the Christian doctrines of hierarchy and ideologies of social enclosure implicit in such a narrative may not be welcome by other cultures.

Silko's traveling and gardening stories create what Homi Bhabha called "the third space" for generating messages and wisdom through conversation across gender and racial differences. Such a space is a process of hybridity that "displaces the histories that constitute it, and set up new structures of authority, new political initiatives, which are inadequately understood through received wisdom" (211). Such messages that are worked through witnessing may motivate responsible actions for sustainable life. The subjects who address or respond to such messages, as demonstrated by the strong females in Silko's novel, feel blessed in the power of understanding, and move beyond sexist and racist complementarity.

The stories of the transnational and cross-cultural traveling of the white and indigenous mixed-blood characters across national and cultural borders chronicle the scenarios of diverse and uneven production of mobility. The crisscrossing between routes of migration and roots of acculturation constitutes a relief map of cultural survival and environmental sustainment in an endangered mobile world. With the inter-pollinated implications of traveling, gardening, and story-telling one can read Silko's *Gardens* allegorically and regard the planet as a Tree of Life and read the communal knowledge of immunity as a Tree of Knowledge. Blessing is from the sap of the Tree of Knowledge—rooted in many places of the Tree of Life and can be tracked from diverse cultural routes.

Andres R. Edwards points out that "[t]he diversity of cultures and perspective from around the world highlights the importance of metaphors for inspiring people to rally around sustainable values," for "[c]reative metaphors help us visualize and understand complex sustainability issues." Oral traditions of Native Americans provide a repertoire of wisdom and experiences of sustainability not only for the indigenes but also for peoples around the world. In *Gardens*, Silko offers a global vision of "interior journey" and provides strategies for a sustainable future.

Works Citied

Adamson, Joni. "Coming Home to Eat: Re-imagining Place in the Age of Global Climate Change." *Tamkang Review* 39.2 (June 2009): 3-26. Print.

Allen, Paula Gunn, ed. *Spider Woman's Granddaughters: Traditional Tales and Contemporary Writing by Native American Women*. New York: Fawcett, 1989. Print.

Anzai, Shin-ichi. "Transplantation of the Picturesque: Emma Hamilton, English Landscape, and Redeeming the Picturesque." *Gender and Landscape: Renegotiating Morality and Space*. Ed. Lorraine Dowler, Josephine Carubia, and Bonj Szczygiel. London and New York: Routledge, 2005. 55-74. Print.

Awiakta, Marilou. *Selu: Seeking the Corn-Mother's Wisdom*. Golden, Colorado: Fulcrum P, 1993. Print.

Bhabha, Homi. "Interview with Homi Bhabha: The Third Space." *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*. Ed. Jonathan Rutherford. London: Lawrence & Wishart, 1990. 207-21. Print.

Clifford, James. *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard UP, 1997. Print.

Cresswell, Tim. *On the Move: Mobility in the Modern Western World*. New York and London: Routledge, 2006. Print.

_____. "The Production of Mobilities." *New Formations* 43 (2001): 11-25. Rpt. in *The Cultural Geography Reader*. Ed. Timothy S. Oakes and Patricia L. Price. London and New York: Routledge, 2008. 326-33. Print.

Edwards, Andres R. *The Sustainable Revolution: Portrait of a Paradigm Shift*. Gabriola Island: New Society P, 2005. Print.

Fortier, Anne-Marie. "Diaspora." *Cultural Geography: A Critical Dictionary of Key Concepts*. Ed. David Atkinson, Peter Jackson, David Dibley and Neil Washbourne. London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2005. 182-87. Print.

Hawken, Paul. *Blessing Unrest: How the Largest Movement in the World Came into Being and Why No One Saw It Coming*. New York: Viking, 2007. Print.

Hawken, Paul, Amory Lovins, and L. Hunter Lovins. *Natural Capitalism: Creating the Next Industrial Revolution*. New York: Little, Brown and Co., 1990. Print.

LaDuke, Winona. "Food as Medicine: The Recovery of Traditional Foods to Heal the People." *Recovering the Sacred: The Power of Naming and Claiming*. Cambridge, MA: South End P, 2005. 191-210. Print.

Leed, Eric J. *The Mind of the Traveler: From Gilgamesh to Global Tourism*. New York: Basic Books, 1992. Print.

Luna-Firebaugh, Eileen M. "The Border Crossed Us: Border Crossing Issues of the Indigenous Peoples of the Americas." *Wicazo Sa Review* 17.1 (2002): 159-81. Print.

Massey, Doreen. "A Global Sense of Place." *The Cultural Geography Reader*. Ed. Timothy S. Oakes and Patricia L. Price. London and New York: Routledge, 2008. Print.

McKibben, Bill. *Deep Economy: The Wealth of Communities and the Durable Future*. New York: Times Books, Hery Holt and Co., 2007. Print.

Merchant, Carolyn. *Reinventing Eden: the Fate of Nature in Western Culture*. New York and London: Routledge, 2003. Print.

Mills, Sara. *Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism*. London: Rutledge, 1993. Print.

Oakes, Timothy S. and Patricia L. Price, eds. *The Cultural Geography Reader*. London and New York: Routledge, 2008. Print.

Porter, Joy. "History in Gardens in the Dunes." *Reading Leslie Marmon Silko: Critical Perspectives through Gardens in the Dunes*. Ed. Laura Coltelli. Pisa: Pissa UP, 2007. 57-72. Print.

Silko, Leslie Marmon. *Gardens in the Dunes*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1999. Print.

_____. "Interior and Exterior Landscapes: The Pueblo Migration Stories." *Yellow Woman and a Beauty of the Spirit: Essays on Native American Life Today*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1996. 25-47. Print.

Snodgrass, Mary Ellen. *Leslie Marmon Silko: A Literary Companion*. Jefferson, North Carolina, and London: McFarland & Co., 2011. Print.

Urry, John. *Mobilities*. Malden, MA: Polity P, 2007. Print.

Waldman, Carl. *Encyclopedia of Native American Tribes*. Rev. ed. New York: Checkmark Books, 1999. 269-70, 233. Print.

_____. *Atlas of The North American Indian*. New York: Checkmark Books, 2000, 181-82. Print.

Wesley, Marilyn C. *Secret Journeys: The Trope of Women's Travel in American Literature*. New York: State U of New York P, 1995. Print.

跨界園冶：席爾柯《沙丘花園》之流動性與永續性

摘　要

席爾柯的長篇小說《沙丘花園》是一部修正主義的旅行書寫，也是一部充滿北美原住民生態智慧的經典作品。本論文藉由分析貫串小說主題的三種活動—旅行、園冶、口傳故事，以及其對應的三大主題—流動性、治療（環境復原）、思維傳承以探討在流動的世界中的環境永續策略。小說刻劃十九世紀末美國鬼舞儀式運動與傷膝事件前後的跨國、跨洋、跨種族人口流動與殖民性掠奪經濟流動。藉由幾位堅強女性的見證，特別是沙蜥族混血原住民姐妹鹽姐(Sister Salt)與靛藍(Indigo)的離散旅行之見聞，席爾柯刻劃不同種族、階級、性別的不同流動性之撞擊及其造成的自然環境破壞與對原住民土地、文化及基本生存條件之戕害。小說所描寫之旅行活動除了對比美國白人的跨國旅遊和混血原住民的跨國流離，還對照資本主義殖民掠奪性流動和原住民的離散流動。小說所描寫之園冶活動則強調不同類型的花園（菜園、果園、植物園、景觀花園）背後不同的文化觀與自然觀。對於殖民性掠奪經濟流動所造成的自然環境破壞及社會不公、環境不正義，治園是一種重要的環境復原與心靈創傷治療途徑。除了指出跨國旅行能讓流離的混血原住民女性有機會做跨文化的園冶交流外，本文亦將此一主題與當前全球性跨國草根性環保永續運動做聯結。

關鍵字：流動性，永續性，旅行，園冶，思維種子