T'ang Legends: History and Hearsay

Charles E. Hammond

ABSTRACT

Though the content of T'ang stories typically concerns the marvelous, they are not fiction, in the sense of a product of the imagination that is a representation of life written to entertain or instruct. The stories are in fact legends (stories alleged to be true as part of an unselfconscious tradition). The misconception that narratives in classical Chinese were fictive was begun by Lu Hsün, who misinterpreted the Ming critic Hu Ying-lin's remarks on the subject. Rather than relying on scholars who wrote so long after the fact, consultation of many sources from the T'ang and Sung dynasties demonstrates that in general, the medieval audience believes the legends to be factual rather than creative products of the imagination.

Historical writings from the T'ang and Sung not only include the same type of marvelous content as the legends, but also refer to identical incidents. Moreover, T'ang compilers of anthologies append notes to individual legends, making it clear that they accept the events in the stories as literal truth. These remarks also often describe the origins of many stories. Indeed, comparison of many legends demonstrates that the many similar stories are in fact differing versions of legends that have evolved through a process of being retold and rewritten.

Sometimes history, and sometimes hearsay, the legends demonstrate a sense of wondering belief in the marvelous that persisted in Chinese narratives—fictional and otherwise—of later times.

KEY WORDS

T'ang narratives
legends
fiction
history
hsiao-shuo
ch'uan-ch'i
chih-kuai
T'ai-p'ing kuang-chi

T'ang stories are not fiction, in the sense of a product of the imagination that is a representation of life written to entertain or instruct. The evidence indicates that rather than creating their stories out of whole cloth, the T'ang writer often hears his stories from other sources. These stories are in fact what folklorists call legends—stories that are alleged to be true as part of an unselfconscious tradition. What one such critic says of modern urban legends also generally holds for their T'ang counterparts: "Legends are told seriously, circulate largely by word of mouth, are generally anonymous, and vary constantly in particular details from one telling to another, while always preserving a central core of traditional elements or 'motifs,'"[1] The only difference—a minor one—is that T'ang readers often circulated the legends in written form.

Presumed intellectual influences aside,[2] most critics draw a distinction between T'ang stories, for which they use the standard but misleading term *ch'uan-ch'i* 傳奇, and their Six Dynasties predecessors, *chih-kuai* 志怪. As examples of *ch'uan-ch'i,* Hu Ying-lin 胡應麟 (1551-1602), a Ming critic, cites "Pu Fei-yen,"[3] "Ying-ying chuan,"[4] "Huo Hsiao-yü chuan,"[5] and "Yang Kuei-fei wai-chuan,"[6] four love stories that end tragically for the heroine.[7] It is the former element of the love story that is of primary importance to Hu. Moreover, the writing in these four is particularly elegant, with much poetry. Finally, they are all much longer than the typical T'ang legend. Even if we ignore the first criterion and assume that the *ch'uan-ch'i* is to be defined as a fairly long T'ang story that includes a poem, we will find it fits only a very few of the thousands of T'ang legends. In fact, this definition could also be applied to many *chih-kuai* stories from the earlier period.[8]

Hu admits that the terms *ch'uan-ch'i* and *chih-kuai* are loose, and that some stories may be characterized as either. Aside from pre-T'ang works, he characterizes as *chih-kuai* the contents of the anthologies *Hsüan-shih chih,*[9] *Yu-yang tsa-tsu,*[10] and *Hsiao Hsiang lu.*[11] His contemptuous remarks about the last demonstrate that he disapproved of the marvelous; this seems to be the main reason that he believed *chih-kuai* to be artistically inferior to *ch'uan-ch'i.*[12] Besides their marvelous content, the selections in these three books share a relative concision. Since they include the occasional poem, the perceived difference between the two genres seems to have centered on the disparity in length. Hence, if one is to draw a distinction, by far the majority of T'ang stories should be termed *chih-kuai.*[13] The term legend refers to both.

Lu Hsün 魯迅 props up his argument that T'ang stories are fiction by

quoting Hu Ying-lin, who says that T'ang scholars deliberately invented strange adventures,[14] but he omits an important part of the Ming critic's discussion. Hu declares that while "Mao Ying chuan"[15] and "Nan-k'o t'ai-shou chuan"[16] are somewhat better than "Tung-yang yeh kuai lu"[17] and Yüan Wu-yu,[18] the literary quality of these stories is not worth mentioning. He concludes by praising only the love stories recorded in *T'ai-p'ing kuang-chi* for their sentiment and elegance, as well as for the poetry they quote.[19]

With one exception, the group of T'ang legends he initially mentions are about scholars who turn out to be objects or animals. "Mao Ying chuan" is superficially similar, being simultaneously a man's biography and the description of an object. Clearly, Hu feels that the other works are the same type of *tour de force* as Han's, but we should on no account construe this to mean that he thinks all T'ang legends were fiction. In fact, he is condemning T'ang stories that are fictitious by design.

As we have seen, he also identifies love stories as *ch'uan-ch'i*. He clearly does not mean to designate them as intentional fiction, since he interprets "Ying-ying chuan" as the author's personal experience. Moreover, he similarly declares that the stories of "Huo Hsiao-yü" and "Liu Shih chuan" are probably true.[20] Yet of the other stories of women, he writes that several are false. These include "Chiu-jan k'o chuan,"[21] "K'un-lun nu,"[22] and "Hung-hsien,"[23] which he says are not believable, and "Liu Yi,"[24] which he says is nonsense with no factual basis.[25] Notwithstanding the fact that these are among the most popular stories from the period, from these on the whole contemptuous remarks,[26] it is plain that even if he did think of some stories as creative works, for Hu the accent was on the authors' weakness in failing to record events correctly, rather than on the artistry their style or content displayed. Instead of discussing creativity, Hu puts the emphasis on the stories which are hearsay that the authors presume to be true.[27] This is important, because he is the major authority for this genre distinction.[28]

Evidence that the medieval audience believes the legends to be factual rather than creative products of the imagination can be found in many sources from the T'ang as well as the Sung dynasty. First of all, historical writings from the two periods not only include the same type of marvelous content as the legends, but also quote from them. Second, in editing anthologies, their T'ang compilers frequently append notes to individual legends, where they make it clear that they accept the events in the stories as literal truth. Finally, these notes also often describe the origins of many stories. Indeed, comparison of many legends demonstrates that the many similar

stories are in fact differing versions of legends that have evolved through a process of being retold and rewritten.

Scholars of Chinese use the word "fiction" to translate the Chinese term *hsiao-shuo* 小說, but the two are far from identical. In fact, T'ang and Sung sources identify a single story as an allegory (*yü-yen* 寓言). "Chen chung chi" is one story that might seem to be truly fictional. Yet even here, in the course of a dream career, the hero meets actual historical figures.[29] Li Chao 李肇 (fl. 806-829) identifies the story as an allegory, and Li Fang's 李昉 (925-996) anthologists also record it as one.[30] It is highly significant that this is the only legend singled out as an allegorical work. The fact that these authorities classify only this legend as an allegory suggests that the T'ang readership accepts the legends as factual. Indeed, at least one Sung writer believes this story is literally true, rather than an allegory. Wu Tseng 吳曾 (fl. ca. 1127-1162) contends that Lü Tung-pin 呂洞賓 (fl. ca. 860-900) is a Taoist transcendent; his wondering whether the old man who gives the protagonist the pillow is Lü shows that he accepts the legend as factual.[31]

In fact, *hsiao-shuo* is often a miscellaneous category. The fact that early *hsiao-shuo* is relegated sometimes to history, sometimes to philosophy demonstrates the vagueness of the term. By the beginning of the T'ang, the *Sui shu* includes *hsiao-shuo* in the philosophical category.[32] The editor Wei Cheng quotes an earlier historian's phrase: "*Hsiao-shuo* is to be defined as 'street gossip.'"[33] He further explains that it is worth noting as a barometer of the feelings of the masses, then concludes with part of a quotation from Confucius.[34] Significantly, the bibliographical section of the *Sui shu* places some of the books that we would now consider fiction or folklore under the heading of history. In an explanatory note to the historical section, Wei speaks of an author who writes "biographies of transcendents, biographies of scholars, and biographies of women," all in one breath. To him, these subjects are all equally real. Wei admits that many of the works he lists under history have much that is exaggerated and weird, but insists they are historical.[35] The *Chiu T'ang shu,* finished shortly after the T'ang,[36] classifies nearly all anthologies of tales of marvels under the rubric of historical biographies of ghosts and spirits.[37] As we have defined it, fiction is distinct from history, but the traditional Chinese conception of history includes ideas alien to the modern Western one. However, to limit one's inquiry to the bibliographies will result in the mistaken notion that the historians of the Sung Dynasty are evolving towards a rejection of the marvelous.[38] Nothing could be farther from the truth.

For example, several of the dynastic histories record chapters on the *wu-hsing* 五行 (five phases), weird phenomena generally understood as indications that the universe was suffering from an imbalance. Like the *Sui shu,* the *Chin shu*[39] was written in the early T'ang; both include anecdotes of people who die and then revive, and of the appearance of spirits or of animals in unusual places or behave strangely, sometimes even speaking. Many of these are similar to those incidents the legends record.

In the T'ang, such ideas were still current, as the *wu-hsing* sections of both T'ang histories attest. The earlier text records that in 807, someone's transformation into a tiger is halted only by dousing him water.[40] The *Hsin T'ang shu* includes a slightly different version of the same incident, as well as another who changes to the extent that his body is covered with hair, and two others who actually become tigers.[41] The later history also tells of a person who revives from the dead in 886, to which it appends an anecdote of a person who changes sex. It concludes that this indicates the rise of a rebel.[42] Barring the change of sex, all of these marvelous "historical" incidents differ from the legends only in their brevity.[43]

Frequently there is little difference between the *hsiao-shuo* version and the "historical" one, even when the marvelous is involved. The modern reader might expect a historian to prune the marvelous elements in processing the legend of Hsieh Hsiao-e 謝小娥 (fl. ca. 813-818). In both versions, after her father and husband have been killed, the heroine receives a clue to the killers' identities in a dream. The Sung editor still believes in the content of dreams as very real.[44]

The historians similarly treat other stories as factual (many earlier versions from the legend anthologies are preserved in *T'ai-p'ing kuang-chi*)[45]. The biography of P'ei Chou-shien 裴伷先 is an abridged version of an earlier story,[46] recorded apparently simply because of P'ei's amazingly good luck. Yang Shen-chin 楊愼矜 (fl. 743-747) was slandered by Li Lin-fu 李林甫 (fl. ca. 713-752) and Wang Hung 王鉷 as having pretensions to the throne. The earlier T'ang history records that before his death, he sees a ghost that vanishes only after he makes offerings to it.[47] One *hsiao-shuo* version under his name describes Yang suing Li Lin-fu and Wang Hung in the underworld;[48] Wang and his clan are executed five years after Yang's death. More to the point, in another legend under Yang's name, the account of the haunting is similar to that of the history.[49]

The treatment of Chang Chih-fang 張直方 (fl. ca. 850-881) in the two histories and a legend, "Wang Chih-ku wei hu chao hsü" also illuminates the

link between history and legend. In the legend, we are told of Chang's misbehavior, and that he "always set snares on the main roads," to catch animals, which he frequently kills. When people criticize this behavior, his mother wonders, "Is there anyone who still respects my son?"[50] The *Hsin T'ang shu* version informs us not only that he kills servants at the smallest provocation, but even quotes from the legend, telling how Chang "always set snares on the roads" (omitting one character), and his mother's remark as well (changing the final question particle). These two close paraphrases indicate that the historian Sung Ch'i has read the legend; however, he has balked at retelling the story encapsulated in the title.[51]

Some of the biographies in the *Hsin T'ang shu* are patently apocryphal. One of the more striking of these is that of Lo Ssu-yüan 羅思遠. The historical version simply tells of the consequences of his ability to make himself invisible. The legends record his name slightly differently, as Lo Kung-yüan 羅公遠. When Lo refuses to fully reveal his secret of invisibility to the emperor Hsüan-tsung 玄宗 (r. 713-755), who is under his tutelage, the latter angrily orders the magician's execution. Both versions end with the imperial envoy meeting Lo, still alive, in the provinces.[52]

While Sung Ch'i clearly accepts such weird biographies, a few such also appear among those selected by Liu Hsü, the compiler of the earlier dynastic history. His treatment of the legend of Yeh Fa-shan 葉法善 as little more than an exorcist—much more realistic than the TPKC legends told about Yeh—suggests that he is more skeptical than the later historian.[53] Yet the treatment of the life of another magician, Chang Kuo 張果, which also appears in a legend version and a biography in both histories, shows more acceptance of the marvelous. In all three versions, Chang feigns death to avoid a summons to the court of Wu Tse-t'ian 武則天 (r. 684-704). In the two earlier versions, he subsequently predicts an imperial proposal to marry him to a princess, then drinks poisoned wine, which renders him unconscious, ruining his teeth; yet he revives with new ones. In all three versions, he matches his powers against those of two other magicians.[54]

T'ang legends provide biographical details and often discuss their subject because the writers believe the stories are factual, rather than because of any influence of the conventions of historical writing. "Especially in an oral tradition that is considered true (like legends), circumstantial details of name, place, time, and situation often enter into narrators' performances."[55] Indeed, compilers of T'ang legends sometimes have recourse to historical records to establish factual proof.[56]

The motivation for writing the stories is often similar to that of historians. Liu Tsung-yüan 柳宗元 (773-814) records the legend of Li Ch'ih 李赤, who falls in love with a spirit that inhabits toilets, finally drowning himself. In his appended remarks, Liu writes, "Li Ch'ih's biography is certainly not false. Was this behavior the effect of a diseased mind? Or must we believe that the ghost exists?" His didactic purpose is identical with the historian's.[57]

The anonymous editor of *Yüan-hua chi* 原化記 frequently cites outside sources to establish the factual nature of his legends. In "Hua-t'ing yen-tien," he tells of an adulteress who steals from her neighbor. When he accuses her, she reviles him, and so does her husband, who refuses to believe the neighbor's accusation that his own wife is an adulteress as well as a thief. He further vows that he should be struck down by a thunderbolt if it is true. That evening, she and her husband, as well as their children, are killed by thunderbolts. The author says that this is heaven's punishment, and quotes from the Confucian classics to prove his point.[58] Similarly, at the end of "Cheng Ts'e," the story of a Taoist who dies as predicted, the anonymous writer paraphrases a Taoist work, describing belief as an act of faith with entering the ranks of the transcendents as the reward.[59]

Niu Seng-ju, a high official, edited *Hsüan-kuai lu,* one of the most famous anthologies of legends. His editorial remarks occasionally explain his purpose in recording these legends.[60] "Chang Ch'ung-nu" is named after a concubine of Liu K'un 劉琨 (271-318), whom the protagonist meets in 821. She complains that she has been singing for an old fox since her husband was killed. Then the experience proves to have been illusory. Niu remarks, "I have looked at the world through Confucianism, which shows that when people die, there are definitely ghosts. When I look at it through Buddhism, as to the meaning of reincarnation, its principle is clear. How could this entertainer be dead a thousand years[61] and still be singing in the netherworld darkness? Thus I believe in the expression of what has been seen and heard, there are things that the classics do not mention."[62] Yet though the classics do not mention them, they do concede their existence. Since they do, we should not ignore them, but rather study them.

In the story of the same name, Yin Tsung-chih has an encounter with a woman, whose shoe he keeps. After he discovers it is a pig's trotter and he trails the blood to the sow's sty, she is killed. Niu states that Tsung-chih's subsequent lack of success is due to his mistreatment of the pig.[63]

In "Kuo Tai kung," the pig is evil. Kuo Yüan-chen (656-713) rescues

a girl from a pig spirit, criticizing her parents and fellow villagers for offering her to the evil creature, and then puts it to death. Niu comments: "The lord's nobility enabled him to hold high office. The matter was already decided in advance—it is clear that although he was born in a distant place and cast away from ghosts and gods, in the end they could not harm him."[64] Like most of his contemporaries, Niu believes that great men are fated to succeed.

The concern with fate appears in many other anthologies, including *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu*. "Liang kuo Wu kung Li Su" records a dream of one of Li Su's (773-821) attendants, presaging his master's promotion to minister as well as his being welcomed as a transcendent. One month after his promotion, Li dies. The author explains: "People of the time praised Li for his attitude of benevolence, mercy, uprightness and honesty, all in accord with the Way; how could they know that he was not a transcendent, who would leave when his term of exile was up? The matérials of his career as an official are written in the state history,[65] so I will not record them here."[66] Here the author indicates that *hsiao-shuo* is a kind of hsitory.

An examination of the legends in *San-shui hsiao-tu*, a late T'ang anthology in which the author, Huang-fu Mei, repeatedly refers to himself is similarly instructive. At the end of the story of Pu Fei-yen he states that he himself has circulated this legend (to which the people of San-shui have responded by bemoaning her fate).[67] When we consider his remarks in the light of those he appends to his other stories, it is clear this discussion of its provenance is not simply to camouflage his own creativity.

Given the contemporary beliefs in *wu-hsing*, it should be no surprise to see that Huang-fu Mei expresses his belief in them, too. "Kuang-ming keng-tzu ta feng yü chih yi" describes the effects of a violent cyclone, ending by telling how the ornaments on the roof of the Long Summer Gate in Loyang have been blown away. "I thought it was a bad omen. In the eighth month, the enlisted soldiers, including Li Hsün-kuang and 1500 of his followers, returned from Goose Gate Pass to plunder the southern market of the eastern capital. Burning the Long Summer Gate, they left. Since then, China has been in a state of chaos. How can the warnings which Heaven sends down be without substance?"[68] Clearly Huang-fu believes in such occurrences as Heaven-sent warnings: the chaos is a reference to the Huang Ch'ao (fl. ca. 873-884) rebellion.[69]

At the end of one legend, Huang-fu explicitly identifies his writing with history. "Yin Pao-hui ch'i Feng shih ma tsei ssu" concerns the tragic death

of a chaste woman from a distinguished family, who is murdered for rejecting a rebel's advances. The author concludes by explaining that Yin's brother told him the legend, and "because of my historical studies, he had me supplement the lacunae of the historians."[70] This would be suitable for a biography because of the heroine's loyalty. Huang-fu Mei concludes "Cheng ta wang p'in Yen Kao nü wei tzu fu," the title of which explains the reason for Yen's daughter's death, by saying "Yen's wife was my wife's aunt, so when I heard these facts [*shih* 實], I transmitted them."[71]

Such a belief is even more clearly expressed in the introduction to *Yi-shih,* which has survived apart from the legends preserved in TPKC:

> Having finished *Shih-lu,* I, Scholar Lu, have collected the odd things I have heard and seen and called the book *Yi-shih.* It includes spiritual transformations and transferences, responses and communications with the world of the dead, fated rises and falls, and fortune and disasters foreseen. All I have done is to choose those that are veritable, and supply what was missing. Altogether I have recorded forty-five selections, which are all matters of our T'ang dynasty. The eighth month of the first year of Ta-chung [847].[72]

We may interpret the word translated as "veritable" (*shih* 實) either as authentic, in the sense that the autor is wary of having the incorrectly retold fictional stories of other writers foisted off on him (in which case it confirms that the stories are hearsay), or it means factual, in which case the author believes that he is recording facts. The second interpretation is much more likely, given his legends concerning avenging ghosts, transcendents, and fate.

This is the case with a legend of revenge that overlaps with historical works. When Sung Shen-hsi 宋申錫 (fl. 821-833), plans to have his enemy Cheng Chu 鄭注 (d. 835) arrested, one of Sung's own men, Wang Fan 王璠 (fl. 810-838) betrays his patron to Cheng, who then frames the plotter. As a result, Sung dies in exile. This much is found in Sung's biographies.[73] In the legend named after Sung, after his death, Sung appears to his wife in a dream, predicting the time of Wang's execution. According to historical sources, Wang dies in 838, though the method of execution differs from what we find in the legend.[74] Since all four characters in the legend are historically documented, and since T'ang readers and writers believed in the reality of ghosts as well as of dreams, they would accept this legend as factual.

We see Lu's didactic motivation in a note appended to the legend of

Yang Leng 楊稜, in "Li Yü." Yang changes his name from Leng (awe), to Chien (儉 simplicity), to show he is in tune with Taoist sensibilities, but instead of finding Heaven, he finally dies in exile. The editor exhorts us: "If you do not truly love the divine domain of true transcendents, you cannot go there by relying on your name. Henceforth, keep this warning in mind!"[75] Like the historians, Lu sees his stories as serving an admonitory function.

We know the compilers no more fabricate their own stories than the authors of histories invent their biographies. Comparison of the remarks appended to stories of varying degrees of plausibility within individual anthologies as well as comparison with the beliefs revealed in the histories demonstrates that when the writers state they believe the stories, there is no reason not to accept their remarks at face value. Since the stories are generally not works of the imagination, there arises the question of where they have come from. That the details of the legend's vary from one rendition to another (sometimes with very slight modifications) establishes the authors collected their writings from other sources.[76]

Despite the contention that they are written as an outgrowth of the *ku-wen* movement,[77] the legends are by no means circulated exclusively in a written format. As Wen T'ing-yun 溫庭筠 (ca. 813-870) writes in the foreword to his anthology *Kan sen-tzu,* "I speak of the weird to amuse my guests."[78] At the end of many of the legends, including some of the most famous, the editors provide their sources, which are often oral. The editors of many books often write of how they have personally heard or read the legend and assume that it is factual.

So too do the authors of the better-known works often claim that they are second-hand. Ch'en Hsüan-yu 陳玄祐 (fl. ca. 766-779), the author of "Li hun chi," the legend of a girl who splits into two souls, writes that he has heard this legend from the girl's relative.[79] "Liu Yi," about a man who marries a dragon spirit, is often recounted by someone who claims to have talked to him, so the writer himself finally records it. When Po Hsing-chien 白行簡 (776-826) tells him about the virtuous prostitute Li Wa 李娃 first heard the legend from either his brother Po Chü-yi 白居易 (772-846), or the latter's friend, Yüan Chen, Li Kung-tso suggests he write it down.[80]

After he himself has heard the legend of "Lu Chiang Feng ao chuan" (who meets a ghost) at a gathering where his friends are telling legends, Li Kung-tso records it.[81] Li is also on record as having heard "Ku yüe tu ching" from a friend as they were discussing the marvelous.[82] It was at a similar

meeting that Shen Chi-chi heard the legend he recorded as "Jen shih chuan."[83]

A few legends are told by those who have directly participated in the experience. The author concludes "Chang Chih,'. a legend of someone called to the underworld by mistake, then revived. "In 811, Chih was a sheriff in P'eng-ch'eng, and I, Scholar Li, was in charge; surprised at his dissolute spirit, I talked of marvels to guide him, and so Chih told me all of this."[84] Similarly, the title of "Hsia-hou Chen tu nü ling Huang-fu Mei wei T'ao nai mian" summarizes the author's role in rescuing his imprudent friend; a role that Huang-fu Mei narrates in the first person.[85]

The author Chang Tu identifies his sources at the end of a few of his legends in *Hsüan-shih chih*. After retelling the story of "Tung Kuan"—a typical visit to the underworld—he adds he heard it from Kuan.[86] He begins "Cheng Sheng" with the words, "Popular legend has it that several days after a person dies, there is an animal that comes out of the coffin. . . ." continuing with eyewitness accounts.[87]

Li Liang, the author of *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu,* repeatedly states the sources for individual legends. The protagonist of "Chang Feng" finds himself at a gathering of friends where he divulges his brief existence as a weretiger.[88] At the end of "Mu kung Ts'ai Jung," Li Liang says everyone in the area spoke of the protection a water spirit afforded the title character, so he feels it must be true.[89] "Ch'ien Fang-yi" tells of a person who agrees to copy the "Diamond Sutra" to help a spirit that haunts his toilet; he later relates the incident to Li Liang.[90] At the end of "Hsin Kung-p'ing shang hsien," after telling how Hsin is brought to visit transcendents, and his subsequent career correctly predicted, Li concludes that he heard it from Hsin's son and "recorded the facts to warn those who are arrogant about the Way."[91]

Niu Seng-ju frequently makes such remarks in *Hsüan-kuai lu.* "Chang Lao" is the legend of a rich family's poor son-in-law who proves to be a transcendent, and spurns his wife's family. The editor Niu Seng-ju explains that a person who heard the story suggested he record it. In the legend "Chang Tso,"[92] Niu Seng-ju writes that the titular character had told it to his uncle, indicating that he has heard it from the latter. Similarly, at the end of "Liu Fa-shih,"[93] which tells of a visit to a Taoist heaven, Niu says: "The county commissioner of Chao-ying county,[94] Hsüe Kan, told this to my, Seng-ju's, uncle."[95]

There are other examples of this retelling that also appear in Western sources: one that is verifiably from an oral source is the Cinderella legend

recorded in *Yu-yang tsa-tsu.*[96] Much less well-known is "Pan-ch'iao San-niang-tzu," also a foreign legend. In the Chinese version, the titular character is a woman who runs an inn and transforms men into asses.[97]

The foreign influence is even stronger in "Lang-chou Mo-yao." After the hero removes a splinter from an elephant's foot, the elephants present him with a giant tusk.[98] "Huai-nan lieh-che" and "An-nan lieh-che" are two versions of the legend influenced by the legend of the Ba 巴 , a monstrous snake that ate elephants. An elephant carries the titular character into the jungle, leaving him in a tree to witness the arrival of the gigantic creature that feeds on the elephants. When the hunter shoots the monster, the elephants reward him from their cache of tusks.[99]

Just as the preface from *Yi-shih* establishes that the editor is transcribing what he has witnessed, similarly, the title of Niu Su's *Chi wen* itself indicates that the author has recorded what he has heard, not what he himself has imagined. Since the authors are not creating these wild visions, as they tell us, we know that they have read the legends in other contemporary sources, and recopy them from memory, or have heard them second- or third-hand from other readers. The reduplication of an identical work in several anthologies suggests this. For example, TPKC identifies the legend "Lo Kung-yüan" as a work from *Shen-hsien kan-yü chuan,*[100] *Hsien-chuan shih-yi,*[101] as well as *Yi-shih;*[102] "Hei sou" as from both *Hui-ch'ang chieh-yi lu*[103] and *Ho-tung chi,*[104] "Yang Kuo-chung" from both *Kuang-yi chi* and *Hsüan-shih chih;*[105] and "Chai Ch'ien-yu" from both *Yu-yang tsa-tsu* and *Hsien-chuan shih-yi.*[106] All are legends with at least two attributed sources. Even if the TPKC is occasionally unreliable, several legends have appended notes attesting that they were based on earlier written versions. Just as we disseminate today's legends through the mass media as well as orally, T'ang raconteurs often find their material in others' books.

A few legends state this explicitly. At the end of the legend of Pu Fei-yen, Huang-fu Mei explains that he has received it in written form. "Cheng Chieh" records a visit to the underworld, revealing facts concerning a character's previous existence, and ends noting that the protagonist's husband has made forty pages of notes about the experience.[107] "Chang Kuang-ting," a legend about a turtle who saves a little girl, begins with the claim that it is from Ch'en Chung-kung's *Records of Weird Things Heard.*[108] "T'ang Hsüan" ends by referring the reader to an otherwise unknown work called "T'ang Hsüan Notes."[109]

Hsüan-shih chih mentions two such written sources. "Seng Ch'i-hsü"

tells of a visit to a land of transcendents, which the story identifies as Chih-ch'uan. After he has heard of it, "Cheng once transmitted this affair, calling it 'Notes of Chih-ch'uan'."[110] "Ch'en Yen" is the story of an ape spirit that appears to the titular character as a woman, saying her husband, a man named Liu, has taken another wife who has mistreated her. Liu reveals that the ape he had raised ran away after his dog bit it. The author concludes, "Unable to figure it out, Liu recorded the affair in order to pass it on. . . . A tenant of mine travelling in T'ai-yüan happened to rest at the retreat of the Copper Pot Inn. Among the Buddhist books in the retreat, he found the account Liu had written, but the writing was very poor. Later he lost the book, but told it to me as it is."[111]

"Tu Tzu-ch'un," the story of a dream leading to enlightenment, originates in another foreign legend. The famous legend tells of a religious who showers a man with wealth to purge him of his secular desire, requiring the latter to assist him by maintaining his silence. Dreaming that he is reborn into another existence, the man finally breaks his vow when his spouse threatens to murder their child.

The principle difference in the earliest version in Chinese is that the assistant's rebirth is into a Brahman family.[112] In the shortest version, "Ku Hsüan-chi." *Yu-yang tsa-tsu* explicitly identifies the religious man as a Taoist who plans to transmute gold. Significantly, Tuan Ch'eng-shih himself compares this version with Tripitaka's, but convinced that the earlier one was a factual story, he claims that the later one is an error.[113] In "Hsiao Tung-hsüan," apparently the last of the T'ang versions, the Taoist, seeking immortality, asks for assistance from a man whose self-control is such that he does not cry out when his arm is crushed.[114]

Although it is not the latest version, by far the best is "Tu Tzu-ch'un," justly the most famous. When he receives the money the third time (the tripartite motif is a folk element), Tu, the future assistant, uses it to settle the affairs of his relatives. Th torture that the spirits inflict on him is more ruthless than that of the other stories: after seeing his wife sliced up alive, he is finally reborn as a woman. In itself a form of punishment for a man, it increases Tu's distance from his earlier incarnation, and makes the murder (this time, no threat) of his child even more heart-rending. As the Taoist tells him, his heart has been purged of all emotions but love. If one truly desires immortality, one must cut all one's worldly ties.[115]

The TPKC has dozens of legends that use the same plot; in itself this is of little significance other than in proving what kind of legends were popular.

However, a number of legends are extant in at least two nearly identical versions; the minor differences are due to the author's lapses of memory or the poor condition of his written sources. "Wu Ch'ing ch'i," and "Yang Ching-chen" are two versions of the same story. In the first, the heroine Yang Chien-chen 楊監眞 is the wife of the village headman Wu Ch'ing, and in the second, Yang Ching-chen is the wife of a peasant, Wang Ch'ing 王清. The resemblances of the names indicate that one version was copied from the other. The story of the woman's visit with transcendents is much the same in both stories, though the poetry is different, and the second is much more detailed, including her presentation to the Emperor.[116]

Two nearly identical legends are told about a man whose wife accompanies him to a temple where she is struck senseless. He then finds a magician – Yeh Ching-neng in "Yeh Ching-neng shi" – and Yeh Hsien-shih 葉仙師 (Transcendent Master Yeh) in "Li Chu-po ch'i," who must cast three spells before the spirit releases her. To Lu Chao, the author of the latter version, the practical relevance of the experiecne is important (he takes it as proof that women should not enter temples), but the other more religious author points out that there are reasons for the spirits' behaving as they do.[117]

Ch'i Tui's daughter, whose legend appears in three different versions– "T'ien Hsien-sheng," "Ch'i T'ui nü," and "Ch'i Jao-chou" – offends a spirit by her pregnancy, who kills her. Master T'ien, disguised as a village schoolteacher, is actually a major official in the underworld who sends the guilty spirit off to be punished, bringing the woman back to life, gluing her souls together to provide a mortal shell. Again the stories are almost identical, though "Master T'ien," apparently the latest version, is less detailed.[118]

The fact that the stories were frequently copied is also evident in a number of legends that are based on incidents that find their way into the more historical work *Kuo-shih pu*. For instance, several legends portray Li Mo as a famous flute player whose skill is overshadowed by an erudite old man who displays his technique by shattering a flute. Though written perhaps only twenty years after the earlier version, the *Yi-shih* legend is already more embroidered. In "Lü Hsiang-yün," the old man warns that if blown, the largest of his flutes will destroy humanity, crumble the earth, and extinguish the sun and the moon. The second largest will cause flying birds to drop dead, and animals to burst their brains. Though the smallest, which he blows to prove his point, merely makes waves and causes fish to shoot into the air, his listeners are frightened.[119]

Three anthologies include several versions of a story reminiscent of Hsieh Hsiao-e's biography. Li Chao again tells a bare-bones version, presumably the earliest. A woman who has been a traveler's concubine for several years suddenly disappears, only to reappear one night clutching the severed head of her father's enemy. After a tearful farewell, she returns to slit the throats of their two children, then leaves again.[120]

In the *Yüan-hua chi* version, "Ts'ui Shen-ssu," the poor protagonist's landlady insists on becoming only his concubine because of her class. Later, his suspicions of her adultery turn to amazement when he sees her return with the head of her enemy. Shortly after parting and leaving her wealth with him, she returns to kill her baby. The author explains that this was to avert a feud, praising her for being the equal of the knights-errant (*hsia* 俠) of former days.[121]

In "Ku jen ch'i," the impoverished protagonist meets a merchant's beautiful widow. The major difference is that she claims she will leave only temporarily, but after moving to a nearby village, her erstwhile mate receives no news from her.[122]

Even by T'ang standards, the heroine is unusually independent; in "Hsieh hsiao-e chuan," this daughterly loyalty is extended to the heroine's husband. In that more famous legend, she kills her father's murderer while simply imprisoning her husband's, then refuses suitors out of loyalty to her late husband. In a variation – "Ni Miao-chi" – she ends as a nun, renouncing all male companionship.[123]

Copyist's errors are also indicative of recopying. While "Chen chung chi" was considered an allegory, there were earlier legend versions, including Ying-t'ao ch'ing-yi."[124] In turn, cherry (*ying-t'ao;* 櫻桃) is probably a corruption of "Yang Lin,"[125] the Six Dynasties prototype, as the similarity of the forms of the characters in the original title suggests. In "Nan-k'o tai-shou chuan"[126] the sound of "Nan-k'o" itself betrays a similarity to "*lan-k'o*" 爛柯, or rotten haft, from the story of Wang Chih 王質 of the Chin dynasty, whose axe handle rotted as he watched a pair of transcendents play *go.*[127] It is unlikely these are coincidences.

Tuan Ch'eng-shih notes that the character 聻 was written on doors as a talisman to ward off ghosts, aware that a misprint is involved. "Feng Chien" is the apparent origin of the error. Though Feng is praised by his teacher as a person who can see ghosts, the text has been recopied so many times that when a fragment, including the words "Of those who can control ghosts, none is better than Chien" (當今制鬼過漸耳) is discovered, the

last two characters, written vertically, are misprinted as one.[128]

"The Ancient Classic of Rivers and Streams" when compared with Li Chao's version, yields several variants. The former version renders the official's name as Li T'ang 李湯 , whereas in the latter it is Li Yang 李陽 ; the name of the beast he has fished out of the water is Wu-chih-ch'i, rendered as 無支奇 in the former version and 無支祈 in the other. Moreover, the wholly unknown work mentioned in the title of the first is rendered in the second as *Shan-hai ching* 山海經 (*The Classic of Mountains and Seas*), a still extant work (though the surviving edition does not record the beast under either name).[129]

"Kuan Ssu-fa" and a variant tell of a servant who uses her supernatural powers to humiliate her master. In Tuan Ch'eng-shih's variant of this legend, Niu is the wet nurse for the family of Kan Ts'ang-fa 闞倉法 (Secretary Kan who works at the Granary Bureau. The similarity of the names of the two masters as well as their titles are crucial evidence of copying), and it is her own son, rather than her grandson, who is compared to Kan's. When the two playmates are not treated identically, Niu makes the two children identical. Afterwards, becoming increasingly disenchanted with her, her master plots her murder, and hit from behind, in one version, she turns into a length of wood, which they burn, but then she reappears. When Kuan tries to report her to the government, he sees that Niu has sent his double first.[130]

In the other version, when Kan tries to hit her, he hits the frame of the door instead. (The fact that her assailant strikes the wood of the door frame rather than a block of wood would indicate an error in transmission.) Instead of reporting her, her master worships her.[131] Presumably Tuan's version is later, since he lived several decades after the other writer.

Finally, there is a group of legends revolving around a friendship that is dissolved when one of the friends seeks a career as an official. After having relinquished the effort to become a transcendent in favor of secular success, he meets his friend, whom he initially pities for his poverty. Yet ironically, the latter's attainment of the Way has also brought him wealth. Moreover, the transcendent summons the successful official's wife, or wife-to-be. Later returning to the mansion, the worldly official finds it deserted.

In "Chang Li erh kung," when Chang, the transcendent, invites his old friend Li to his mansion, the official is struck by the astonishing resemblance of one of the entertainers to his own wife. After attaching a crab apple to her skirt, Chang gives him an old hat to redeem at a certain herbalist's. Upon Li's return home, where he sees the crab apple, his wife tells him she

dreamt she was summoned to play the lute for Transcendent Chang.[132]

"P'ei Ch'en" is set at the beginning of the T'ang dynasty. This version begins with three friends, one of whom dies before they have achieved anything. When Wang Ching-po, the successful official, visits P'ei, the transcendent, the latter instructs one of the entertainers to join Wang, who is surprised to see his wife; she is as astonished as he. Here it is her own husband who gives her a red plum. When he returns home, his wife is angry about what she considers his use of magic to humiliate her (she was unable to keep up with the other ladies on the lute) until he explains how she was summoned.[133]

Yi-shih, compiled at about the same time, records "Lu Li erh sheng." Li's career is less successful; he has fled, unable to make good the losses his dishonest subordinates have caused. During the banquet, Li notices a beautiful lute player, upon whose lute is a ten-character couplet, written in red. Lu speaks to him about marrying the girl, and gives him a staff that he redeems at a Persian's shop. Later after marrying her he discovers the red verse on her lute; she says her brothers had written it when they were younger, and that she dreamt of a summons from a transcendent.[134]

The focus of "Hsüe Chao" is on the Taoist. Originally there are four colleagues studying the Way, but first two give up, then Ts'ui Yu passes the civil service examination, leaving Hsue to attain the Way. After effecting a miraculous cure, he meets Ts'ui. At the transcendent's house a beautiful entertainer sits next to Ts'ui, holding a lute with the same ten characters on it; the couplet is the same as in the previous story. Hsue promises her to him, and gives him thirty catties of gold. A month later, Ts'ui marries a woman who proves to be the same one; she too has a lute with the ten characters on it.[135]

Though there are several details that are slightly modified from one version to another, like that of the sum of money, it is the wife's appearance at the banquet that is of most interest. In the first version, the Taoist attaches a crab apple to her skirt; in "P'ei Ch'en," it is a "red plum" (*chu-li;* 朱李); in "Scholars Lu and Li," and "Hsüe Chao," it has become "ten characters" (*shih-tzu;* 十字), and she is not the Confucian's wife yet, but will be in the future. The characters for *chu-li* and those for *shih-tzu* are somewhat similar; these changes arise from miscopying or misreading, yet the texts must have been in very sorry shape indeed to have changed the stories so much: after all, one could hardly substitute "ten characters" for "red plum" and make sense of the legend.

Despite the fact that the content of T'ang legends typically revolves around the marvelous, there is ample evidence that their contemporary authors and readers generally accept them as factual. Although they may have functioned similarly to fictional stories in entertaining and teaching their audience, they are not fiction, and their presentation proves it. (The fact that they are legends does not rob these stories of literary interest). Their editors continually emphasize that rather than creative works of the imagination, they are sometimes history, and sometimes hearsay. The implications for readers of Chinese literature are important: far from being the earliest Chinese fiction, these legends demonstrate a sense of wondering belief in the marvelous that persisted in the narratives – fictional and otherwise – of later times.

Notes

1. Jan Harold Brunvand. *The Vanishing Hitchhiker,* (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1981), p. xii.
2. Victor H. Mair, "Scroll Presentation in the T'ang Dynasty," Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies, 38:1 (1978), 35-60 has exposed the error in the supposition that writers presented their stories their civil service examiners.
3. 步非煙, *San-shui hsiao-tu* 三水小牘 (*Little Notes of San-shui*), comp. Huang-fu Mei 皇甫枚 (873-910), (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1960), pp. 45-9.
4. 鶯鶯傳 ("A Biography of Ying-ying"), by Yüan Chen 元稹 (779-831), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo* 唐人小說 (*T'ang Stories*), comp. Wang P'i-chiang 汪辟疆 (Shanghai ku-chi ch'u-pan she, 1978), pp. 135-40.
5. 霍小玉傳 ("A Biography of Huo Hsiao-yü"), by Chiang Fang 蔣防 (n. d.), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo* pp. 77-82.
6. 楊貴妃外傳 ("The Unofficial Biography of Yang Kuei-fei"), by Yüe Shih 樂史 (930-1007), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* pp. 124-134.
7. Hu Ying-lin, *Shao-shih shan-fang pi-ts'ung* 少室山房筆叢 (*Shao-shih Mountain Studio Notes*), (Taipei: Shih-chieh shu-chü, 1980), p. 374.
8. Cf. Kenneth J. DeWoskin, "The Six Dynasties *Chih-kuai* and the Birth of Fiction," In Andrew Plaks, ed., *Chinese Narrative* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977), pp. 21-53.
9. 宣室志 (*Palace Chamber Records*), comp. Chang Tu 張讀 (833-888).
10. 酉陽雜俎 (*A Bibliophile's Salmagundi*), comp. Tuan Ch'eng-shih 段成式 (803-863), (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1981).
11. 瀟湘錄 (*Records of the Hsiao and Hsiang Rivers*), comp. Liu Hsiang 柳祥 (n. d.).
12. Hu Ying-lin, pp. 374, 419. He categorizes the first two together with Six Dynasties anthologies.
13. This is, in fact, the usage adopted by Karl Kao, ed., *Classical Chinese Tales of the Supernatural and Fantastic* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1985).
14. Lu Hsün, *Chung-kuo hsiao-shuo shih-lüeh* 中國小說史略 (*A Short History of Chinese Fiction*), (Peking: Jen-min wen-hsüeh ch'u-pan-she, 1952), p. 85.
15. 毛穎傳 "Mao Ying chuan," Han Yü, *Han Ch'ang-li chi* 韓昌黎集 (*Collected*

Works of Han Yü), (Hong Kong: Commercial Press, 1964), 7.6-8.

16. 南柯太守傳 ("A Biography of the Nan-k'o Prefect"), by Li Kung-tso 李公佐 (fl. ca. 786-846), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, pp. 85-90.
17. 東洋夜怪錄 ("Record of a Night of Weird Creatures at Tung-yang"), anon., in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, pp. 199-204.
18. 元無有 ; this character's name can also mean "Originally nonexistent;" from *Hsüan-kuai lu*, 玄怪錄 (*Records of the Strange and Mysterious*), comp. Niu Seng-ju 牛僧儒 (779-847), in *Hsüan-kuai lu, Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu* 玄怪錄,續玄怪錄, ed. Chiang Yün 姜云 et al. (Shanghai ku-chi ch'u-pan she, 1985), pp. 21-23. In their preparation of this edition, the editors have relied heavily on a Ming edition whose attributions are sometimes at odds with those in the TPKC.
19. Hy Ying-lin, p. 486.
20. Ibid., p. 560; apparently their realism satisfies him.
21. 虬髯客傳 ("A Biography of the Curly-bearded Hero"), by Tu Kuang-t'ing 杜光庭 (850-933), *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, p. 178.
22. 崑崙奴 ("The K'un-lun Slave"), from *Ch'uan-ch'i* 傳奇(Reports of Marvels) comp. P'ei Hsing 裴鉶(fl. ca. 860-878); in Wang Meng-ou, *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo yen-chiu*, vol. I (1971), p. 107.
23. 紅綫 , from *Kan-tse yao* 甘澤謠 (*Sweet Moisture Rumors*), comp. Yüan Chiao 袁郊 (fl. ca. 860-903), *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, p. 260.
24. 柳毅 , by Li Ch'ao-wei 李朝威 (fl. ca. 790-800), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, pp. 62-8.
25. Hu Ying-lin, pp. 568, 477; it seems to be their lack of verisimilitude that strikes him.
26. Cf. Ibid., p. 374, where he also criticizes those who convey the stories to others.
27. Ibid., pp. 475-476, 482-3.
28. For instance, Karl Kao, *Chinese Tales*, pp. 22-26, refers to Lu Hsün's citation of Hu Ying-lin to support his allegation that the T'ang writer generates new tales by the self-conscious manipulation of old materials, in distinction to the Six Dynasty authors who write with reference to external reality. But unless the marvelous (including spirits, portents, and magic) has by the T'ang lost an earlier concrete existence, Six Dynasty writers also manipulate extant themes. Since later scholars still believe in the marvelous, unlike modern scholars, they are not motivated to reject it as superstition.
29. 枕中記 ("Record from Inside a Pillow") by Shen Chi-chi 沈既濟 (fl. ca. 750-800), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo* p. 37.
30. *Kuo-shih pu* 國史補, (*Supplement to the State History*), comp. Li Chao, *hsia*, 4a; *Wen-yüan ying-hua* 文苑英華 (*Flowerings of the Garden of Literature*), comp. Li Fang et. al., (Taipei: Hua-wen shu-chü ching-yin, 1965), pp. 5244-5.
31. *Neng-kai chai man-lu* 能改齋漫錄 (*Free Recllections from the Neng-kai Studio*), comp. Wu Tseng, Ts'ung-shu chi-ch'eng, pp. 437-8.
32. 隋書 (*Sui History*), comp. Wei Cheng 魏徵 (580-643), (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü 1973), 34.1014. Bibliographers ahd come to divide books into four classes: 1) classics, 2) philosophy, 3) history, and 4) collections of *belles-lettres* by single authors.
33. This is a quotation from the bibliographical chapter of the *Han shu* 漢書 (*Han History*), comp. Pan Ku 班固 (32-92), 30.1745.
34. This is also by way of the *Han shu*. Confucius' original, *Analects* 17:14 reads: "The Master said, to tell in the lane what you have heard on the highroad is to

throw merit away." (*The Analects of Confucius*, Arthur Waley, tr., New York: Vintage Books, 1938, p. 213).

35. *Sui shu*, 33.981-2.
36. 舊唐書 (*Old T'ang History*), comp. Liu Hsü 劉昫 (887-926), (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1975).
37. *Chiu T'ang shu*, 46.2005-6. The bibliography includes only works extant in the period 713-741, before T'ang stories flourished.
38. DeWoskin, "*Chih-kuai*," p. 48.
39. (*Chin shu* 晉書), comp. Fang Hsüan-ling 房玄齡 (578-648) and Li Yen-shou 李延壽(fl. ca. 627-649) (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1974).
40. *Chiu T'ang shu* 37.1375.
41. A second T'ang history, *Hsin T'ang shu*, 新唐書 (New T'ang History), comp. Ou-yang Hsiu 歐陽修 (1007-1071) and Sung Ch'i 宋祁 (989-1061), (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1975). Ironically, though the bibliography classifies nearly all anthologies of marvel legends as *hsiao-shuo* in the philosophical category rather than as history (58.1541-3), the *wu-hsing* section and the bibliography demonstrate more acceptance of the marvelous.
42. *Hsin T'ang shu* 36.954-5.
43. The overlapping between T'ang legends and the *wu-hsing* selections is something they share with their Six Dynasty counterparts. Cf. DeWoskin, "*Chih-kuai*," p. 42. Indeed, the *wu-hsing* chapter of *Chin shu* cites as an expert Kan Pao 干寶 (fl. ca. 317), editor of *Collected Records of the Spirits* (*Sou shen chi* 搜神記), (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1979).
44. *Hsin T'ang shu* 205.5827-8; an abridgement of "Hsieh Hsiao-e chuan" 謝小娥傳 (Biography of Hsieh Hsiao-e), by Li Kung-tso 李公佐 (786-846), from *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo* pp. 93-5.
45. 太平廣記 (*A T'ai-p'ing Miscellany*); hereafter TPKC, comp. Li Fang et. al. (Peking: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1983).
46. *Hsin T'ang shu* 117.4249-50, from "P'ei Chou-hsien," in *Chi wen*, from TPKC 147.1058-9.
47. *Cf. Chiu T'ang shu* 105.3228 for Yang's biography, which includes the incident in question.
48. From *Chi wen*, in TPKC 121.855.
49. From *Hsüan-shih chih*, in TPKC 356.2128.
50. 王知古爲狐招婿 ("Wang Chih-ku Is Asked by Foxes to Be Their Son-in-law"), from *San-shui hsiao-tu* pp. 12-17.
51. *Hsin T'ang shu* 212.5981; and *Yu-yang tsa-tsu*, p. 24.
52. *Hsin T'ang shu* 204.5811; *Yi-shih* 逸史 (*A Record of Fugitive Events*), comp. Lu Chao 盧肇 (fl. ca. 842-870), in TPKC 22.46-50. This story is also attributed to other anthologies; see the discussion below.
53. *Chiu T'ang shu* 191.5107-8.
54. "Chang Kuo," from *Hsüan-shih chih*, in TPKC 30.192-4; *Chiu T'ang shu* 191.5106; *Hsin T'ang shu* 204.5810-11.
55. Brunvand, p. 19. Note that a significant difference of the T'ang legends is that they are often written as well as oral.
56. At the end of the legend of Hui Chao 惠照 (from *Hsüan-shih chih*, in TPKC 92.612), an account of an exceedingly long life, the editor adds that he believes it is true because he has compared it to specific histories.
57. *Complete Works of Liu Tsung-yüan* (*Liu Ho-tung ch'üan chi*, 柳河東全集),

(Taipei: Shih-chieh shu-chü, 1963), pp. 211-2.

58. 華亭堰典 ("The Hua-t'ing Dikereeve") from *Yüan-hua chi* (*Records of the Origins of Transformations*), anon., in TPKC 393.3142-3. The citations include several sources. "Upon hearing a sudden clap of thunder or a violent gust of wind, he must change countenance;" from *Analects*, 10:15. (This chapter is concerned with the proper bearing of a Confucian gentleman or superior man; Arthur Waley's translation, p. 151). "When there came violent wind, or rapid thunder, or a great rain, he changed countenance. It was the rule for him then, even in the night, to get up, dress himself, put on his cap, and take his seat;" from *Book of Rites* (*Li chi* 禮記), adapted from James Legge, tr., (New Hyde Park, New York: University Books, 1967) vol. II, p. 4. (Again the reference is to the Confucian gentleman.) "The trigram representing thunder, being repeated, forms the hexagram *chen*. The superior man, in accordance with this, is fearful and apprehensive, cultivates his virtue, and examines his faults;" from the *Book of Changes* (*Yi ching* 易經), hexagram 51; adapted from *I Ching* (New York: Bantam Books, 1969), James Legge, tr., p. 330.
59. "Cheng Ts'e" 鄭冊, from *Yüan-hua chi*, in TPKC 49.304-5. The reference is to *Chen-kao*, 眞誥 (*Declarations of the Perfected*), comp. T'ao Hung-ching 陶弘景, (fl. ca. 502-556), Ts'ung-shu chi-ch'eng ed., 16.1a-b.
60. Note that the TPKC versions of the *Hsüan-kuai lu* legends often omit Niu's remarks.
61. This is poetic license; only a little over four centuries have passed.
62. This is apparently a reference to a frequently-quoted phrase from the *Analects* 7:20: "The Master never talked of prodigies, feats of strength, disorder, or the spirits." (Waley's translation, p. 127). This is usually interpreted as a criticism of fiction. The legend, 張寵奴, appears in *Hsüan-kuai lu*, pp. 114-117.
63. 尹縱之; *Hsüan-kuai lu*, pp. 122-6.
64. 郭代公 ("Kuo, Lord of Tai") Ibid., pp. 23-6; cf. *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, pp. 212-4, where the title is rendered "Kuo Yüan-chen;" following Wang P'i-chiang's version, the last lines would read ". . . although he was master of a distant place and hidden from gods and ghosts, in the end they could not harm him."
65. *Chiu T'ang shu* 133.3678; *Hsin T'ang shu* 154.4874-78.
66. 凉國武公李愬 ("Li Su, Martial Lord of Liang"), in *Hsu Hsüan-kuai lu* (*Supplement to Records of the Strange and Mysterious*, 續玄怪錄) comp. Li Liang 李諒 (775-833), also known as Li Fu-yen 李復言, in *Hsüan-kuai lu, Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu*, pp. 159-60.
67. *San-shui hsiao-tu*, pp. 45-9. Cf. "Wang Chih-ku wei hu chao hsü," discussed above as a historical source: Huang-fu identifies it as hearsay.
68. 廣明庚子大風雨之異 ("A Wonder of the Rainstorm of 808"), in *San-shui hsiao-tu*, pp. 24-5.
69. Cf. Huang Ch'ao's biographies, *Chiu T'ang shu* 200 *hsia* 5391-8 and *Hsin T'ang shu* 225 *hsia* 6451-64.
70. 殷保晦妻封氏罵賊死 ("Yin Pao-hui's Wife Curses a Bandit and Dies"), in *San-shui hsiao-tu*, pp. 23-4.
71. 鄭大王聘嚴郜女爲子婦 ("Great King Cheng Betroths Yen Kao's Daughter to His Son"), in *San-shui hsiao-tu*, pp. 27-8.
72. *Shuo-fu* 說郛 (*A Place of Discussion*, comp. T'ao Tsung-yi 陶宗儀 (fl. ca. 1360), (Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1927), 24.21. *Shih-lu* 史錄 (*Historical Accounts*) has since been lost, and the TPKC attributes seventy-eight selections to *Yi-shih*.
73. *Chiu T'ang shu* 167.4370-72; *Hsin T'ang shu* 152.4844-6.

74. From *Yi-shih,* in TPKC 122.164-5.
75. 李虞 ; Ibid., 42. 267.
76. The question of which tradition is more important for T'ang legends is probably impossible to answer, since despite the fact that the authors received their material from outside sources, in the majority of cases, they do not specify them; without that explanation, those that were originally oral (in the sense of being anecdotes, rather than story-tellers' materials) have no detectable vestiges of that character.
77. The contention that the *ku-wen* 古文 (ancient prose) movement influenced the stories is dubious, both on grounds of the legends' style and content.
78. This line from the preface to *Kan sen-tzu* (*Charqui*) is quoted in *Chün-ch'ai tu-shu chih* (*Chun-ch'ai's Bibliography*), comp. Ch'ao Kung-wu (1131-1163), Taipei: Kuang-wen shu-chü, 1967), 13.10a.
79. 乾𦠆子 ("A Record of Divided Souls"), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* p. 49.
80. "Li Wa chuan" 李娃傳 ("Biography of Li Wa"), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* pp. 100-6.
81. 盧江馮媼傳 ("A Biography of Old Woman Feng of the Lu River"), in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* p. 98.
82. 古岳瀆經 ("The Ancient Classic of Rivers and Streams"), from *T'ang-tai hsiao-shuo yen-chiu* 唐代小說研究 (*A Study of T'ang Stories*), Vol. II; ed. Wang Meng-ou 王夢鷗, (Taipei: Yi-wen yin-shu kuan, 1973), pp. 193-5.
83. 任氏傳 ("The Biography of Mme. Jen") in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* pp. 43-8.
84. 張質 , in *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 170-2.
85. 夏侯禎黷女靈皇甫枚爲禱乃勉 ("Hsia-hou Chen Insults a Female Spirit and Huang-fu Mei Prays for Him and Saves Him"), in *San-shui hsiao-tu,* pp. 21-2.
86. 董觀 , in TPKC 346.2742-3.
87. 鄭生 ("Scholar Cheng"), in TPKC 366.2905. At the end of "Yu sou" 俞叟 ("Old Man Yu"), in TPKC 74.461-2, an anecdote of a magician, one of the characters reveals the story to a group of friends speaking of the spiritual and the weird.
88. 張逢 , in *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 193-5.
89. 杜蔡榮 ("Ts'ai Jung the Carpenter"), Ibid., pp. 201-2.
90. 錢方義 , Ibid., pp. 189-192.
91. 辛公平上仙 ("Hsin Kung-p'ing Achieves Transcendence"), Ibid., pp. 154-8.
92. 張佐 , Ibid., pp. 70-5.
93. 劉法師 ("Dharma Master Liu"), Ibid., pp. 85-7.
94. In present-day Lin-t'ung county in Shensi province.
95. 張老 ("Old Chang"), in *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 9-13.
96. Cf. Arthur Waley, "The Chinese Cinderella Story" in *Folklore,* 88 (1947), pp. 226-238.
97. 板橋三娘子 ("Third Lady of the Wooden Bridge Inn"), from *Ho-tung chi* 河東記 (*East River Records*), comp. Hsüe Yü-ssu 薛漁思 (n.d.), TPKC 286.2279-81. There are similar stories in Greco-Roman literature (St. Augustine's *City of God*), and *The Arabian Nights.* Still closer geographically is a Kirghiz version. See Alex Scobie, "Notes on Walter Anderson's "Marchen vom Eselmenschen'," *Fabula* 15, (1974) pp. 222-231, "Ass-men in Middle, Central, and Far Eastern Folk Tales," *Fabula* 16 (1975), and "A Chilean Ass-Tale," *Fabula* 17 (1976).
98. 閬州莫徭 ("The Lang-chou Tribesman"), from *Kuang-yi chi* 廣異記 (*Comprehensive Records of the Extraordinary*), comp. Tai Fu 戴孚 (d. ca. 800), TPKC 441.3600-1.

99. 淮南獵者 ("The Huai-nan Hunter"), Ibid., in TPKC 441.3601-2, and 安南獵者 ("The Annamese Hunter"), from *Chi wen,* in TPKC 441.3602-3.
100. 神仙感遇傳 (*Reactions of Encountering Gods and Transcendents*), comp. Tu Kuang-t'ing.
101. 仙傳拾遺 (*Amended Biographies of Transcendents*), comp. Tu Kuang-t'ing.
102. 羅公遠 , in TPKC 22.46-50.
103. 會昌解頤錄 (*A Hui-ch'ang Jokebook*), comp. anon.
104. 黑叟 ("Old Blackie"), from TPKC 41.259-60.
105. 楊國忠 , from TPKC 335.2660-1.
106. TPKC 30.194-5.
107. 鄭潔 , from *Po-yi chih* 博異志 (*Extensive Records of the Extraordinary*), comp. Cheng Huan-ku 鄭還古 (fl. ca. 806-839), in TPKC 380.3028-9.
108. 張廣定 , from *Tu-yi chi* 獨異志(*Records of Solitary Wonders*), comp. Li K'ang 李亢 (n. d.), in TPKC 472.5885; *Yi-wen chi* 異聞記 , which it attributes to Ch'en Chung-kung 陳仲弓 ; the extant book by this name does not include this story, and is not Ch'en's work.
109. 唐晅 , from *T'ung-yu chi* 通幽記 *Records of Understanding the Marvelous*), comp. Ch'en Shao 陳劭 (n. d.), in TPKC 332.2635-7.
110. 僧契虛 ("The Monk Ch'i-hsü"), in TPKC 28.184-6; Chih-ch'uan 稚川 is the cognomen of Ko Hung 葛洪 (284-363), the Taoist author of *Pao p'u tzu* 抱朴子 (Master Embracing Simplicity).
111. 陳巖 , from TPKC 444.3631-32.
112. *Ta T'ang hsi-yu chi* 大唐西遊記 (*T'ang Record of a Journey to the West*), comp. the monk Tripitaka (known as Hsüan-tsang 玄奘 ; 596-644), (Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1933), p. 95.
113. *Yu-yang tsa-tsu,* p. 238.
114. 蕭洞玄 , from *Ho-tung chi,* in TPKC 44.276-8.
115. 杜子春 , from *Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 3-8. Unlike the editors of this recent edition of the two books, the TPKC identifies this as a story from *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu.*
116. 吳清妻 ("Wu Ch'ing's Wife"), from *Yi-shih,* in TPKC 67.418-9; and 楊敬眞 , from *Hsü Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 151-4; significantly, the *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo* version of this legend (pp. 215-7) renders her name as Yang Kung-cheng 楊恭政.
117. 李主溥妻 ("Secretary Li's Wife), from *Yi-shih,* in TPKC 378.3012; 葉淨能詩("A Poem of Yeh Ching-neng"), included in a longer legend about Yeh Ching-neng in *Tun-huang Transformation Texts* (*Tun-huang pien-wen* 敦煌變文) ed. Wang Ch'eng-min (Peking: Jen-min wen-hsüeh, 1957), pp. 216-229.
118. 田先生 ("Master T'ien"), from *Hsien-chuan shih-yi,* in TPKC 44.274-5;齊推女 ("Ch'i T'ui's Daughter"), from *Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 99-102, with the third legend in Ibid., pp. 93-99.
119. *Kuo-shih pu, hsia,* 6a; 李譽 , from *Yi-shih,* in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* p. 265;呂鄉筠, from *Po-yi chih,* in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo,* p. 266.
120. *Kuo-shih pu, chung,* 9a.
121. 崔愼思 , in TPKC 194.1458.
122. 賈人妻 ("The Merchant's Wife"), from *Chi-yi chi* 集異記(*Records of the Extraordinary Collected*), comp. Hsüe Yung-jo 薛用弱 (fl. ca. 821-848), in TPKC 196.1471-2.
123. 尼妙寂 ("The Nun Miao-chi"), from *Hsüan-kuai lu,* pp. 29-32.
124. 櫻桃青衣 ("The Cherry Maid"), from TPKC 281.2242-3, which gives no source for this legend.

125. 楊林 , from *You ming lu* 幽明錄 (*Records of Dark and Light*), comp. Liu Yi-ch'ing 劉義慶 (403-444), in TPKC 283.2253.
126. 南柯太守傳 ("A Biography of the Nan-k'o Prefect"), by Li Kung-tso in *T'ang-jen hsiao-shuo*, pp. 85-90. The shift in pronunciation – either way – is a common phenomenon.
127. Cf. *Shui-ching chu* 水經注 (*The Annotated Water Classic*), comp. Li Tao-yüan 酈道元 (fl. ca. 527), Ssu-pu ts'ung-k'an ch'u-p'ian, p. 514.
128. The legend, 馮漸 , from *Hsüan-shih chih*, is in TPKC 75.470. The misunderstanding would have arisen because the strip of paper with Feng's name on it would have been used as a talisman, even after it had been torn. Cf. Ch'ien Chung-shu 錢鍾書 , *Kuan-chui p'ien* 管錐篇 (*Pivotal Essays*), (Hong Kong: Chung-hua shu-chü, 1979), p. 675. Later the mysterious character was believed to frighten ghosts because just as the living fear ghosts, which are from the next world, so do ghosts fear these creatures, which are what become of ghosts when they die. See Morohashi, s.v.
129. *T'ang-tai hsiao-shuo yen-chiu* vol. II, p. 193; *Kuo-shih pu, shang*, 5a.
130. 關司法 ("Secretary Kuan of the Judiciary Bureau"), from *Ling-kuai chi* 靈怪集 (*Records of Spirits and Oddities*), comp. Chang Chien 張薦 (744-804), in TPKC 286.281-2.
131. *Yu-yang tsa-tsu*, p. 147.
132. 張李二公 ("Gentlemen Chang and Li"), from *Guang-yi chi*, in TPKC 23.158.
133. 裴諶 , from *Hsüan-kuai lu*, pp. 13-19.
134. 盧李二生 ("Scholars Lu and Li), in TPKC 17,118-9.
135. 薛肇 , from *Hsien-chuan shih-yi*, in TPKC 17.120-1; cf. "Ssu-ming Chün" 司命君 ("Lord Arbiter of Fate", in TPKC 27.178-9), a slightly different story from the same book.